| 1  |                                       |
|----|---------------------------------------|
| 2  |                                       |
| 3  |                                       |
| 4  | NODMA GONGALUEG                       |
| 5  | NORMA GONSALVES,<br>Presiding Officer |
| 6  |                                       |
| 7  |                                       |
| 8  |                                       |
| 9  | RULES COMMITTEE                       |
| 10 | RULES COMMITTEE                       |
| 11 |                                       |
| 12 |                                       |
| 13 |                                       |
| 14 | NORMA GONSALVES, Chairwoman           |
| 15 |                                       |
| 16 |                                       |
| 17 |                                       |
| 18 | 1550 Franklin Avenue                  |
| 19 | Mineola, New York                     |
| 20 |                                       |
| 21 |                                       |
| 22 | Monday, December 3, 2012              |
| 23 | 1:10 P.M                              |
| 24 |                                       |
| 25 |                                       |

| 1  |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
|----|----------|---|----|---|---|---|--------|---|---|---|---|----|---|---|----|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|-----|---|--|
| 2  | <u>A</u> |   | Ρ  |   | Ρ |   | Ε      |   | Α |   | R |    | Α |   | N  |   | С |   | E |   | S | : |   |     |   |  |
| 3  |          | _ | _  |   | - |   | ~      | ^ |   | ~ | - | -  |   | _ | ~  |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 4  | N        |   |    |   |   |   |        |   | О |   |   |    | V | Ľ | S  | ′ |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 5  | Η        |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   | _ | 20 |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 6  | Б        |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    | m | a | 11 |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 7  | D        |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    | _ | _ |    | _ | _ |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 8  | R        |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    | Ľ | R |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 9  | K        |   |    |   |   |   | A<br>n |   | R | A | Η | A  | M | S | ′  |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 10 | J        | U | D  | Y |   | J | Α      | С | 0 | В | S |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 11 | W        | Α | Y  | N | E |   | W      | I | N | K |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 12 | W        |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     | _ |  |
| 13 |          | C | Τ. | е | Т | ĸ |        | O | Т |   | L | 11 | e |   | ш  | е | 9 | _ | Б | _ | a | L | u | T ( | Ξ |  |
| 14 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 15 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 16 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 17 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 18 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 19 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 20 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 21 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 22 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 23 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
| 24 |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |
|    |          |   |    |   |   |   |        |   |   |   |   |    |   |   |    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |     |   |  |

| 1  |   |
|----|---|
| 2  | LIST OF SPEAKERS  |
| 3  |   |
| 4  | GREG STEPHANOFF, Sergeant, Nassau County Police Department7 |
| 5  |   |
| 6  | GREG MAY, Director of Legislative Affairs8                  |
| 7  | KEN ARNOLD, Nassau County Public Works8,66,118              |
| 8  |   |
| 9  | BOB McMANUS, Nassau County District Attorney's Office14     |
| 10 | TOM DELANEY, Nassau County OEM62                            |
| 11 | RICH MILLET, Nassau County Deputy                           |
| 12 | Commissioner of Public Works75                              |
| 13 |   |
| 14 |   |
| 15 |   |
| 16 |   |
| 17 |   |
| 18 |   |
| 19 |   |
| 20 |   |
| 21 |   |
| 22 |   |
| 23 |   |
| 24 |   |
| 25 |   |

| 1                    |   |
|----------------------|---|
| 2                    | <u>INSERTS</u>  |
| 3                    | By reference  |
| 4                    | 677-12, 678-12, 680-12, 681-12,<br>682-12, 683-12, 684-21, 685-12,  |
| 5                    | 686-12, 691, 692, 693, 698, 699,<br>700-12, 701-12, 702-12, 703-12, |
| 6                    | 704-12, 705-12, 706-12, 707-12,<br>708-12, 709-12, 710-12, 711-12,  |
| 7                    | 712-12, 713-12, 714-12, 715-12,<br>716-12,717-12                    |
| 8                    |   |
| 9                    | Incorporated Finance Committee Minutes                              |
| 11                   | (Clerk Item 679-12)   |
| 12                   | Page 31, line 12  |
| 13                   | (Clerk Items 694, 695, 696, 697-12)                                 |
| 14                   | Page 34, line 23 through Page 60, line 1834                         |
| 15                   |   |
| 16                   |   |
| 17                   |   |
| 18                   |   |
| 19                   |   |
| 20                   |   |
| 21                   |   |
| 22                   |   |
| 23<br>24             |   |
| 2 <del>4</del><br>25 |   |
|                      |   |

| 1  |             | Rules Committee/12-3-12          |
|----|-------------|----------------------------------|
| 2  |             | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The        |
| 3  | meeting is  | now ready to begin. Would you    |
|    |             |                                  |
| 4  | please call | the roll of the Rules Committee? |
| 5  |             | CLERK MULLER: Yes. Legislator    |
| 6  | Wink?       |                                  |
| 7  |             | LEGISLATOR WINK: Here.           |
| 8  |             | CLERK MULLER: Legislator Jacobs? |
| 9  |             | LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Here.         |
| 10 |             | CLERK MULLER: Ranking Member     |
| 11 | Abrahams?   |                                  |
| 12 |             | LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Here.       |
| 13 |             | CLERK MULLER: Legislator Walker? |
| 14 |             | LEGISLATOR WALKER: Here.         |
| 15 |             | CLERK MULLER: Legislator Dunne?  |
| 16 |             | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Here.          |
| 17 |             | CLERK MULLER: Vice Chairman      |
| 18 | Kopel?      |                                  |
| 19 |             | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Here.          |
| 20 |             | CLERK MULLER: Chairwoman         |
| 21 | Gonsalves?  |                                  |
| 22 |             | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Here.      |
| 23 |             | CLERK MULLER: We have a quorum.  |
| 24 |             | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator |

25 Walker, please lead us in the Pledge.

| 1 | Rules  | Commit | tee | / 12 - 3 - 1 | 2  |
|---|--------|--------|-----|--------------|----|
| 2 | (Where | upon,  | the | Pledge       | οf |

- 3 Allegiance was recited.)
- 4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,
- 5 Legislator Walker. Now, before we begin
- 6 with the contracts, we have two addendums in
- 7 Rules pertaining to contracts which we will
- 8 not take up at this potion of the Rules
- 9 Committee, so that we will have sufficient
- 10 time to review those contracts and we'll
- 11 bring in on the second half of the Rules
- 12 Committee.
- 13 Let's begin with the first
- 14 contract.
- 15 CLERK MULLER: Sure. A35-12, a
- 16 resolution authorizing the director of
- 17 Nassau County Office of Purchasing to award
- 18 and execute a contract between the County of
- 19 Nassau acting on behalf of Nassau County
- 20 Police Department and Elsag North America,
- 21 LLC.
- 22 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.
- 23 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 25 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | Kopel. Who is here to speak on this one?     |
| 3  | SERGEANT STEPHANOFF: Sergeant                |
| 4  | Gregory Stephanoff from the police           |
| 5  | department to answer any questions.          |
| 6  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you              |
| 7  | very much. Are there any questions of the    |
| 8  | sergeant regarding this contract? You want   |
| 9  | to give us a description of the contract?    |
| 10 | SERGEANT STEPHANOFF: Sure. This              |
| 11 | is a service contract that will cover three  |
| 12 | years maintenance on the license plate       |
| 13 | readers for the asset forfeiture unit. The   |
| 14 | license plate readers are just one tool that |

18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any

they use to collect data for the

intelligence lead policing. This is asset

19 questions from any of the legislators?

20 (No verbal response.)

21 Is there any public comment

22 regarding this?

forfeiture funded.

15

16

17

23 (No verbal response.)

24 There being none, all those in

25 favor of this contract signify by saying

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 aye.
- 3 (Aye.)
- 4 Any opposed?
- 5 (No verbal response.)
- The contract passes unanimously.
- 7 Thank you.
- 8 CLERK MULLER: Sure. B21-12, a
- 9 resolution authorizing the county executive
- 10 to award and execute a contract between the
- 11 County of Nassau acting on behalf of Nassau
- 12 County Department of Public Works and ZHN
- 13 Contracting Corporation.
- 14 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.
- 15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.
- 16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 17 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator
- 18 Walker. Mr. May?
- MR. MAY: We have Mr. Ken Arnold
- 20 to speak on this item and also B22 and B26.
- 21 If you don't want to call them together,
- that's fine, but he's here for all three.
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you
- 24 very much.
- MR. ARNOLD: Good afternoon. Ken

| 1 | Rules | Committee | /12- | 3 – 12 |
|---|-------|-----------|------|--------|
|   |       |           |      |        |

- 2 Arnold, Public Works. B21 is a construction
- 3 contract for the renovation of the first
- 4 floor of our building which houses our
- 5 laborers, our sewage treatment plant
- 6 operators, locker room facilities, our rest
- 7 area, and the elevator.
- 8 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Just one
- 9 question on that through the chair.
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Okay.
- 11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: How long
- 12 is that going to take, because that's a real
- important place for the workers?
- 14 MR. ARNOLD: I believe it's a
- 15 nine month contract.
- 16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Nine
- months?
- MR. ARNOLD: Yes. Because as
- 19 there's coordination of activities, they
- 20 have to move people out while they do the
- 21 work.
- 22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other
- 23 questions from any of the legislators?
- 24 (No verbal response.)
- Is there any public comment

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                     |
|----|---|
| 2  | regarding this?                             |
| 3  | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 4  | There being none, all those in              |
| 5  | favor of this contract signify by saying    |
| 6  | aye.  |
| 7  | (Aye.)                                      |
| 8  | Any opposed?                                |
| 9  | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 10 | The contract passes unanimously.            |
| 11 | CLERK MULLER: B22-12, a                     |
| 12 | resolution authorizing the county executive |
| 13 | to award and execute a contract between the |
| 14 | County of Nassau acting on behalf of Nassau |
| 15 | County Department of Public Works and Main  |
| 16 | Line Electrical Corporation.                |
| 17 | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.                 |
| 18 | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.                   |
| 19 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by              |
| 20 | Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator    |
| 21 | Kopel.                                      |
| 22 | MR. ARNOLD: B22 is a contract               |
| 23 | with main line electric. It is to install a |
| 24 | new electrical service the Glen Cove        |

Treatment Plant. The current service is

25

Rules Committee/12-3-12 1 associated with a city building, the old incinerator. The facility is old and needs 3 to be upgraded and also taken off the city 4 5 property. 6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any questions from any of the legislators? 7 8 (No verbal response.) 9 Is there any public comment 10 regarding this? 11 (No verbal response.) 12 There being none, all those in 13 favor of this contract signify by saying 14 aye. 15 (Aye.) 16 Any opposed? 17 (No verbal response.) 18 The contract passes unanimously. 19 Motion carries unanimously. 20 CLERK MULLER: B26-12, a 21 resolution authorizing the county executive 22 to award and execute a contract between the 23 County of Nassau acting on behalf of Nassau 24 County Department of Public Works and

### REGAL REPORTING SERVICE (516) 747-7353

25

En-Tech Corporation.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.                  |
| 3  | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.                    |
| 4  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by               |
| 5  | Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator     |
| 6  | Kopel. Mr. Arnold.                           |
| 7  | MR. ARNOLD: B26 is a contract                |
| 8  | with En-Tech Corporation to do sewer lining  |
| 9  | on the main lateral that runs through the    |
| 10 | City of Glen Cove on First Avenue. This      |
| 11 | will insure that the pipe has no leaks,      |
| 12 | whether in or out, and will increase the     |
| 13 | integrity of the pipe and its strength.      |
| 14 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any                    |
| 15 | questions for Mr. Arnold regarding this      |
| 16 | contract?                                    |
| 17 | LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Just a                 |
| 18 | note that when we objected to taking over    |
| 19 | Glen Cove, this is the reason we objected,   |
| 20 | because there's so much money that has to be |
| 21 | put in to rebuild that darn thing, but we're |
| 22 | going to definitely move it.                 |
| 23 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other              |
| 24 | comments regarding this contract?            |
|    |  |

(No verbal response.)

25

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | Is there any public comment                  |
| 3  | regarding this contract?                     |
| 4  | (No verbal response.)                        |
| 5  | There being none, all those in               |
| 6  | favor of this particular contract signify by |
| 7  | saying aye.                                  |
| 8  | (Aye.)                                       |
| 9  | Any opposed?                                 |
| 10 | (No verbal response.)                        |
| 11 | The contract passes unanimously.             |
| 12 | CLERK MULLER: E223-12, a                     |
| 13 | resolution authorizing the county executive  |
| 14 | to execute an amendment to a personal        |
| 15 | service agreement between the County of      |
| 16 | Nassau acting on behalf of Nassau County     |
| 17 | District Attorney's Office and Family and    |
| 18 | Children's Association.                      |
| 19 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.                 |
| 20 | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.                    |
| 21 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by               |
| 22 | Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator    |
| 23 | Kopel. Who is here to speak on this one?     |
| 24 | MR. MAY: Mr. Bob McManus from                |
| 25 | the District Attorney's Office.              |

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you.             |
| 3  | MR. McMANUS: Good afternoon.                 |
| 4  | The District Attorney's Office utilizes both |
| 5  | grant funding and forfeiture funds for the   |
| 6  | district attorney Terrorist Bidel (phonetic) |
| 7  | Project. Your approval of this item will     |
| 8  | allow the office to utilize unused grant     |
| 9  | funding. Spending on the second chance       |
| 10 | re-entry program grant was lower than        |
| 11 | anticipated.                                 |
| 12 | The purpose of this item is to               |
| 13 | provide additional funding to an ongoing     |
| 14 | program that provides services to the same   |
| 15 | population prior to the expiration of the    |
| 16 | grant funding.                               |
| 17 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any                    |
| 18 | comments from the legislators?               |
| 19 | (No verbal response.)                        |
| 20 | Is there any public comment?                 |
| 21 | (No verbal response.)                        |
| 22 | There being none, all those in               |
| 23 | favor of this contract please signify by     |
| 24 | saying aye.                                  |
|    |  |

(Aye.)

25

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | Any opposed?                                 |
| 3  | (No verbal response.)                        |
| 4  | The contract passes unanimously.             |
| 5  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: At this                |
| 6  | time we are going to recess and, remember I  |
| 7  | said before there are additional contracts   |
| 8  | that were part of addendum two and three?    |
| 9  | Time is needed to review those contracts.    |
| 10 | We will resume the contracts after the       |
| 11 | second session. Thank you very much. Next    |
| 12 | committee is Public Safety.                  |
| 13 | (Whereupon, the Rules Committee              |
| 14 | recessed at 1:19 p.m. and reconvened at 4:15 |
| 15 | p.m.)  |
| 16 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Before we              |
| 17 | continue with the Rules Committee, I need a  |
| 18 | motion to suspend the rules for the addendur |
| 19 | to the Rules Committee.                      |
| 20 | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.                  |
| 21 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.                   |
| 22 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by               |
| 23 | Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator     |
| 24 | Walker. All those in favor signify by        |
| 25 | saying aye.                                  |

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12 2 (Aye.) 3 Any opposed? (No verbal response.) 4 5 There being none, the motion to 6 suspend the rules carries. Many of the items that went through rules have already 7 gone through, that have gone through finance 8 are now before us in rules. 9 10 With permission of the minority, 11 we are going to block a number of those 12 items. Beginning with, and I will call those items, Item 671-12, 672-12, 673-12, 13 14 676-12, 677-12, 678-12, 680-12, 681-12, 15 682-12, 683-12, 684-21, 685-12, 686-12, 691, 16 692, 693, and here we go, 698, 699, 700-12, 701-12, 702-12, 703-12, 704-12, 705-12, 17 18 706-12, 707-12, 708-12, 709-12, 710-12, 711-12, 712-12, 713-12, 714-12, 715-12, 19 716-12, 717-12. Most of these items already 20 21 went through other committees and I'm going 22 to ask that the those committees, Health,
- 25 (Whereupon, the following items,

into the Rules Committee.

Public Safety, and Finance be incorporated

23

24

Rules Committee/12-3-12 1 2 Items 671-12, 672-12, 673-12, 676-12, 3 677-12, 678-12, 680-12, 681-12, 682-12, 683-12, 684-21, 685-12, 686-12, 691, 692, 4 5 693, 698, 699, 700-12, 701-12, 702-12, 703-12, 704-12, 705-12, 706-12, 707-12, 6 708-12, 709-12, 710-12, 711-12, 712-12, 7 8 713-12, 714-12, 715-12, 716-12, 717-12 can be found in the minutes of the following 9 10 meetings; Health Committee, Public Safety 11 Committee, and Finance Committee of 12 12-3-12.) 13 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved. LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second. 14 15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Motion 16 made by Dennis Dunne, seconded by Legislator 17 Walker. Any comments? 18 (No verbal response.) 19 There being none, all those in 20 favor signify by saying aye. 21 (Aye.) 22 Any opposed? 23 (No verbal response.) 24 The items carry unanimously. 25 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I just wanted

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 to say that you deserve so many thanks from
- 3 all of us here. I visited the shelter, I
- 4 visited one of the shelters with Kevan
- 5 Abrahams, and we were really floored and
- 6 amazed at what you provided for the people
- 7 that were in such desperate need. I don't
- 8 think I'll ever forget it. I mean, I never
- 9 expected to see what I saw. I never thought
- 10 I seen anything, like, 970 the day before we
- 11 were there, and they seemed, now listen,
- 12 nothing's great in the shelter, but they
- 13 seemed to be fairly well taken care of and
- 14 they had food and I have to tell you, I
- 15 walked away from there -- I've always been
- 16 proud of the college, but, I mean, I really
- 17 was overwhelmed and proud of the efforts
- 18 that went into what you did. I think it
- 19 should be recognized. Thank you.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other
- 21 comments?
- (No verbal response.)
- 23 I think we took a motion on those
- 24 items. Now we have four items that went
- 25 through finance and we're going to call them

| 1 | Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|
|   |       |           |                 |

- 2 one at a time, and, again, the testimony
- 3 from the Finance Committee please be
- 4 incorporated into the Rules Committee. The
- 5 first item is 679-12. Motion, please.
- 6 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.
- 7 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 9 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator
- 10 Walker.
- 11 (Whereupon, the following are the
- 12 minutes of the Finance Committee pertaining
- 13 to Clerk Item 679-12, 12-3-12.)
- 14 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Item 679 of
- 15 2012 is a resolution to include in the
- 16 proceedings of the Nassau County Legislature
- 17 a statement of the total assessed valuations
- 18 of the property situated in the county, the
- 19 three towns, the two cities, the villages
- 20 within the county of Nassau and the special
- 21 districts.
- 22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.
- 23 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Second.
- 24 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Moved by
- 25 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 Dunne. Mr. Valentino, just briefly what's
- 3 this?
- 4 MR. VALENTINO: This is Item 679.
- 5 This deals with the 2013 tax roll at the
- 6 assessed valuations as they appear on that
- 7 roll and allows them to extend on those
- 8 assessed values.
- 9 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Any other
- 10 questions?
- 11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I have a
- 12 question.
- 13 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Legislator
- 14 Denenberg.
- 15 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Is this --
- 16 when you say the 2013 tax roll, this would
- 17 be the valuation that was final as of April
- 18 1st, 2012?
- MR. VALENTINO: Correct.
- 20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So it
- 21 would include all the tax certs that were
- 22 settled before April 1st, 2012?
- MR. VALENTINO: Depends on when
- 24 those tax certs reached over to the
- 25 assessment department.

| 1 | Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|
|   |       |           |                 |

- 2 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I said
- 3 they were settled before April 1st, 2012.
- 4 MR. VALENTINO: In most
- 5 circumstances, yes.
- 6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Okay.
- 7 March 8, 2012, how's that?
- 8 MR. VALENTINO: In most
- 9 circumstances, yes.
- 10 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So this
- 11 would be -- this would include the roll that
- 12 according to the assessor's office and the
- 13 county executive's office, had all those
- 14 items that were settled I guess that year,
- 15 meaning earlier, earlier calendar year this
- 16 year, but the challenges that were filed in
- 17 January and February, that were settled by
- in house or an outside consultant this year?
- MR. VALENTINO: They were settled
- 20 in house this year. We tried to settle
- 21 as many as we can with ARC and then the
- 22 remaining cases then went to SCAR.
- 23 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: But the
- 24 cases that were settled, I have, based on
- 25 the information I've been able to get, which

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 has been, not total, 90 percent of those who
- 3 challenged were successful with ARC.
- 4 MR. VALENTINO: You're going to
- 5 have to contact the assessment review
- 6 commission with respect to that.
- 7 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: That's
- 8 what they said. They said 90 percent were
- 9 successful. I, for one, who didn't
- 10 challenge, just saw a \$1,200 a year school
- 11 tax increase.
- MR. VALENTINO: That might also
- 13 be dependent upon your school's budget.
- 14 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: No. See,
- 15 there was this thing passed in the state at
- 16 two percent cap. My school district stayed
- 17 within the two percent cap which would have
- 18 given me a 200, about averaging up,
- 19 actually, a \$200 increase, but the fact that
- 20 my assessment stayed the same but a third of
- 21 people challenged and saw whopping
- 22 reductions, my taxes went up, a lot.
- 23 MR. VALENTINO: There is a common
- 24 misconception that the two percent cap means
- 25 a two percent hard cap on your tax bill.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 It's a two percent cap on the budget. There
- 3 are other things that factor into your tax
- 4 bill. It depends on how many property
- 5 owners within that district have an
- 6 exemption. It may be -- if you're school's
- 7 budget went up by two percent, your taxes
- 8 will go up. It's all contingent upon the
- 9 assessed value.
- 10 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Wouldn't
- 11 it also matter whether everyone else in my
- 12 district saw their -- whether others in my
- 13 district saw their assessments go down while
- 14 mine was, let's say, frozen?
- 15 MR. VALENTINO: The two are
- 16 correlated but there's no causation. It's
- 17 not just because they went down, yours is
- 18 going to go up. There are other factors
- 19 that come into play.
- 20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Are you
- 21 saying that if this whole room, or let's
- 22 just say yourself, Legislator DeRiggi,
- 23 Legislator Bosworth and me, we're the, say,
- 24 Bellmore school district, if you're frozen
- 25 and us three went down, you don't think that

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 your taxes, you wouldn't realize a tax
- 3 increase?
- 4 MR. VALENTINO: It depends. What
- 5 happened with the school district's budget?
- 6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Let's say
- 7 it stayed the same, exactly the same.
- 8 MR. VALENTINO: Did they receive
- 9 any exemptions, can you qualify for any
- 10 exemptions?
- 11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Same
- 12 exemptions as last year. Us three went
- down, you stayed the same in terms of
- 14 assessment.
- 15 MR. VALENTINO: In that simple
- 16 example, you have four owners who all
- 17 receive reductions and you remain the same,
- 18 no other factors at play, nothing else going
- 19 on, your taxes will go up.
- 20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Okay. And
- 21 let's say --
- 22 MR. VALENTINO: And there's also
- 23 a lot of things we're assuming there.
- 24 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Well, if a
- 25 third of the people saw their taxes go down,

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 the other 2/3rds that didn't challenge, you
- 3 don't think they're going to see their taxes
- 4 go up?
- 5 MR. VALENTINO: It depends on
- 6 what's going on within the area. There are
- 7 more property owners who could have received
- 8 an exemption -- especially in a down
- 9 economy, you have people qualifying for
- 10 income based exemptions, so when you receive
- 11 an exemption, there's less taxable assessed
- 12 value, it affects everybody.
- 13 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: That
- 14 happens every year.
- 15 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Do you have
- 16 any other questions?
- 17 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I would
- 18 beg you guys that what took place last year
- 19 was 2/3rds of the people saw a tax increase
- 20 because of a policy of simply giving anyone
- 21 who challenges a reduction, whether they
- 22 were substantively entitled to one or not.
- 23 That the effect is 2/3rds of the people see
- 24 a tax increase.
- 25 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Legislator

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 DeRiggi-Whitton.
- 3 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: Just
- 4 with regard to Sandy, have you had any
- 5 thought as to what's going to happen with
- 6 all these homes that have been destroyed in
- 7 the storm as far as their assessment goes?
- MR. VALENTINO: Unfortunately,
- 9 for the '12, '13 tax year, the taxable
- 10 status date is January 2nd, 2011. So it
- 11 goes in the property's use and condition on
- 12 that date. And for most of those homes were
- 13 intact on that date. So the '12, '13 year
- 14 won't be affected. The '13, '14, there's a
- 15 provision in the admin code that allows
- 16 assessment to go out and take a look and
- 17 survey the damage if the homeowner contacts
- 18 the department of assessment.
- 19 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So
- 20 there's a good possibility I believe over
- 300,000 homes have been destroyed, correct,
- 22 or close to that?
- MR. VALENTINO: 300,000 I think
- 24 is a little on the high end.
- 25 LEGISLATOR DeRIGGI-WHITTON:

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 Well, I forget the exact number. But the
- 3 number's significant. So as the assessment
- 4 goes, that's going to have to be considered
- 5 for the next budget, correct?
- 6 MR. VALENTINO: For the next
- 7 year's levy and the next year's tax warrant,
- 8 yes.
- 9 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I
- 10 did hear it was close to that number. I
- 11 don't know. But that's going to have a real
- 12 impact, I would assume, so I would hope that
- 13 we get a lot of information out to those
- 14 people that are going to need it.
- 15 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Legislator
- 16 Denenberg has a question on the item.
- 17 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Yes. On
- 18 April 1st, 2014, the current tentative roll
- 19 will be finalized, correct?
- MR. VALENTINO: 2013. You said
- 21 2014.
- 22 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I'm sorry,
- 23 April 1st, 2013.
- MR. VALENTINO: It gets confusing
- 25 with the dates.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So the
- 3 roll for April 1st, 2013 was, if anyone
- 4 wanted to challenge it, it should have been
- 5 in January, February 2012. But Sandy
- 6 occurred as Legislator DeRiggi-Whitton just
- 7 said, can the assessor's office consider
- 8 property value lost due to Hurricane Sandy,
- 9 whether people challenge or not before April
- 10 1st, 2013?
- MR. VALENTINO: Yes, they can.
- 12 Regardless of whether they challenge, there
- is a provision in the admin code that allows
- 14 for destruction between taxable status
- 15 dates. So the taxable status date for '13,
- 16 '14 was January 2nd, 2012.
- Now if your property was
- 18 destroyed pursuant to fire, demolition or a
- 19 natural disaster, it would be pushed up to
- 20 taxable status date to January 2nd, 2013.
- 21 All the homeowner would have to do is
- 22 contact the department of assessment and
- 23 then we would have to go out and survey the
- 24 damage and see if a reduction in the
- 25 assessed value is warranted.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                     |
|----|---|
| 2  | LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: See,                  |
| 3  | what's interesting about that is, you just  |
| 4  | said, all the homeowner has to do. I would  |
| 5  | beg you that there's facts and              |
| 6  | circumstances, the code you just talked     |
| 7  | about, the provision of the law you just    |
| 8  | talked about would say if you have if       |
| 9  | you, the assessor, has facts and            |
| 10 | circumstances or knowledge that would lead  |
| 11 | you to believe that the value has fallen    |
| 12 | down.                                       |
| 13 | Now, in the case of a fire, you             |
| 14 | might not have that knowledge. In the case  |
| 15 | of some loss that, like, an explosion or    |
| 16 | something happened to a property that's     |
| 17 | unique, you wouldn't necessarily know.      |
| 18 | But, here, the natural disaster             |
| 19 | affected so many areas that, you know, to   |
| 20 | wait for people to call you would seem like |
| 21 | you know, we don't need to do that here.    |
| 22 | I mean, we'll all tell our                  |
| 23 | constituents, please call you, but the firs |
| 24 | time any of us up here have heard that our  |

constituents need to you to call you is just

25

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 now.
- MR. VALENTINO: Well, there is
- 4 the provision in the admin code is Nassau
- 5 County Administrate Code Section 24-1,
- 6 paragraph C, where it says that the
- 7 homeowner has to contact the Department of
- 8 Assessment. Now it's hard for the
- 9 Department of Assessment to know if a
- 10 property is destroyed unless they receive a
- 11 phone call.
- 12 As Legislator DeRiggi-Whitton
- just noted, she said 300,000 homes were
- 14 destroyed. It's hard for the department of
- 15 assessment to pin down and know which houses
- 16 to go and survey unless we receive a call or
- 17 notification, hey, my property was
- 18 destroyed, can you come take a look?
- 19 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Thank you
- 20 very much. That was very information.
- 21 Let's consider this item that's before us.
- 22 We'll ask the Department of Assessment and
- 23 the administration to do some outreach.
- We also have budgets for mailings
- 25 so we can do some as well. I think it would

```
Rules Committee/12-3-12
1
    be wise for elected officials to do that.
2
3
                Anyway, on the item, any public
4
    comment?
5
                (No verbal response.)
6
                Hearing none, all those in favor
7
    signify by saying aye.
8
                (Aye.)
9
                Any opposed?
10
                (Nay.)
11
                The item passes four to three.
12
                (Whereupon, the following is the
    continuation of the minutes of the Rules
13
    Committee, 12-3-12.)
14
15
                CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any
16
    additional comments regarding this item?
17
                (No verbal response.)
18
                Is there any public comment?
19
                (No verbal response.)
                All those in favor of this Item
20
21
    679-12 signify by saying aye.
22
                (Aye.)
23
                Any opposed?
24
                (Nay.)
25
                So, right. Four-three. So 679
```

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                    |
|----|--|
| 2  | is unanimous. Going back to 694-12. All    |
| 3  | right on 694-12, again, the testimony from |
| 4  | the Finance Committee be incorporated into |
| 5  | the Rules Committee.                       |
| 6  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Motion,              |
| 7  | please.                                    |
| 8  | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.                |
| 9  | LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.                 |
| 10 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by             |
| 11 | Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator   |
| 12 | Walker. Any comments regarding this item?  |
| 13 | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 14 | Is there any public comment?               |
| 15 | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 16 | All those in favor of 694 signify          |
| 17 | by saying aye.                             |
| 18 | (Aye.)                                     |
| 19 | Any opposed?                               |
| 20 | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 21 | It passes unanimously. Thank you           |
| 22 | very much.                                 |
| 23 | Item 695, again, it went through           |

finance and that testimony be incorporated

24

25

into rules.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                   |
|----|---|
| 2  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: May I have          |
| 3  | a motion, please?                         |
| 4  | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.               |
| 5  | LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.                |
| 6  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by            |
| 7  | Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  |
| 8  | Walker. Any additional comments?          |
| 9  | (No verbal response.)                     |
| 10 | Is there any public comment?              |
| 11 | (No verbal response.)                     |
| 12 | All those in favor of 695-12              |
| 13 | signify by saying aye.                    |
| 14 | (Aye.)                                    |
| 15 | Any opposed?                              |
| 16 | (No verbal response.)                     |
| 17 | The motion carries unanimously.           |
| 18 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Item                |
| 19 | 696-12, again, testimony from the Finance |
| 20 | Committee be incorporated into the Rules  |
| 21 | Committee.                                |
| 22 | May I have a motion, please?              |
| 23 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.              |
| 24 | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Second.                 |
| 25 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by            |

Rules Committee/12-3-12 1 2 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator Dunne. Any further comment regarding this 3 4 item? 5 (No verbal response.) 6 There being none, is there any 7 public comment? 8 (No verbal response.) 9 All those in favor of Item 10 696-12, signify by saying aye. 11 (Aye.) 12 Any opposed? 13 (No verbal response.) The motion carries unanimously. 14 15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now we have to move to 697-12, again, the testimony 16 17 from finance be incorporated into rules. 18 (Whereupon, the following are the 19 minutes of the Finance Committee pertaining to Clerk Items 694, 695, 696, and 697-12, 20 21 12 - 3 - 12.22 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: I'm going to 23 call the next item, 694, 695, 696, 697 of

### REGAL REPORTING SERVICE (516) 747-7353

2012. These are all resolutions to

authorize the county assessor and/or the

24

25

| 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12 |
|---------------------------|
|---------------------------|

- 2 county treasurer and/or the receiver of
- 3 taxes of the towns of Hempstead and North
- 4 Hempstead and Oyster Bay and the City of
- 5 Long Beach to partially exempt from real
- 6 property taxation certain real property
- 7 situated in various school districts.
- 8 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.
- 9 LEGISLATOR VENDITTO: Second.
- 10 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Moved by
- 11 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator
- 12 Venditto. The item is before the committee.
- 13 I understand we asked you, the Department of
- 14 Assessment, for a legal opinion with respect
- 15 to these items did you want to discuss that
- 16 now?
- 17 MR. VALENTINO: That's correct.
- 18 The issue was the STAR exemption and whether
- 19 Nassau County could be reimbursed for the
- 20 STAR exemption. It's ultimately the school
- 21 districts that are responsible for seeking
- 22 reimbursement. Nassau County is supposed to
- 23 pay out the refund in the first instance,
- 24 assuming the petition is passed.
- 25 Then the school district is then

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 supposed to budget for it in its next budget
- 3 hearings, and then Nassau County is supposed
- 4 to send the school district the bill to
- 5 collect the amount that was charged back.
- 6 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Just give me
- 7 the sequence again. When does Nassau County
- 8 send a bill, at what point does the county
- 9 bill the school districts?
- 10 MR. VALENTINO: It's going to be
- 11 up to the treasurer but it would be sometime
- 12 after the receiver of taxes starts paying
- 13 out the amounts that they're receiving to
- 14 the school districts.
- 15 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: So this
- 16 mechanism is in place in the real property
- 17 tax law?
- MR. VALENTINO: That's correct.
- 19 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Has the
- 20 county been doing this?
- MR. VALENTINO: Not yet. The
- 22 county was going to do it in conjunction
- 23 with the repeal of the county guaranty. We
- 24 didn't want to hit the school districts up
- 25 in the middle of the year and say, hey, you

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 now owe us for these. It was going to be
- 3 done in conjunction with the repeal of the
- 4 county quaranty to allow it to all be done
- 5 at once. We don't want the school district
- 6 to have a shortfall.
- 7 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Once the
- 8 correction is made, then how does the school
- 9 district get notice that there's been a
- 10 correction?
- 11 MR. VALENTINO: The county is
- 12 ultimately going to have to send a bill out
- 13 and notify them to increase their budget
- 14 next year pursuant to the correction error
- 15 that was approved and whatever their pro
- 16 rata share of that refund is, they would be
- 17 notified and they would have to budget for
- 18 it accordingly.
- 19 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: So then they
- 20 budget for it, but they also have the
- 21 ability to gain a refund from the state of
- 22 New York for the amount of the correction?
- 23 MR. VALENTINO: For the STAR
- 24 exemption, yes. They send it directly to
- 25 the Office of Real Property Tax Services,

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | and for each amount that was attributable to |
| 3  | an error that was committed with respect to  |
| 4  | the STAR exemption and then they receive     |
| 5  | reimbursement from the state.                |
| 6  | CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Do they have             |
| 7  | to send it out after they pay it or can they |
| 8  | send it out once the bill is sent to them?   |
| 9  | MR. VALENTINO: I'm not entirely              |
| 10 | sure on the mechanism of how the school      |
| 11 | districts seek the reimbursement. There was  |
| 12 | an addendum that was included with the       |
| 13 | opinion that explained the process that the  |
| 14 | school district has to go through to get the |
| 15 | reimbursement. So I would imagine the        |
| 16 | financial officer for the school district    |
| 17 | would have to keep abreast and of whatever   |
| 18 | changing laws there are and however it is    |
| 19 | supposed to be implemented.                  |
| 20 | CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: When is the              |
| 21 | county going to start doing this, sending    |
| 22 | the letters out to the school districts?     |
| 23 | MR. VALENTINO: They're trying to             |
| 24 | coordinate and figure out what the ADAP      |

25 system and with the tax certiorari refunds

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 how they're going to bill the school
- 3 districts. I'm not sure if there's anything
- 4 currently in place, but I know that they're
- 5 working towards a solution and we should
- 6 have something soon.
- 7 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Will the
- 8 school districts have the ability to then, I
- 9 don't know if the word is participate, but
- 10 be involved before the corrections are made
- 11 and say --
- MR. VALENTINO: It would be
- 13 before the legislature here. They would
- 14 have to appear and tell you -- put their two
- 15 cents in as to whether they think the
- 16 correction of error petition should be
- 17 approved or denied. Once the legislature
- 18 approves, they're responsible for the pro
- 19 rata share of the refund.
- 20 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Pro rata
- 21 share, you mean only their share?
- MR. VALENTINO: Their share,
- 23 correct.
- 24 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: But
- 25 ultimately, according to state law, they're

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 supposed to be made whole in the end?
- 3 MR. VALENTINO: If it's the STAR
- 4 exemption, yes.
- 5 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: So the
- 6 school districts, assuming that they paid to
- 7 the county, will be made whole by the state?
- MR. VALENTINO: Correct.
- 9 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: All right.
- 10 Any other questions? Legislator Denenberg.
- 11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I question
- 12 this, I guess a few months ago at this
- 13 point, and then I appreciate the opinion
- 14 that came back. But I still note, despite
- 15 the questions by Legislator Nicolello, I
- 16 still don't -- help me understand the step
- 17 by step on this. In a regular STAR --
- 18 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Didn't we
- 19 just do this?
- 20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I still
- 21 don't get it.
- 22 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Do like to
- 23 hear yourself, what the heck? I just went
- 24 through it.
- 25 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: This was

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 very easy and you wanted to vote on it two
- 3 months ago. I understand. Now we're
- 4 finding out that it's not that easy and
- 5 we're going to send letters charging the
- 6 schools.
- 7 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: We're not
- 8 going to reiterate step by step. Ask him
- 9 some questions. If you would just listen to
- 10 what we're doing, we wouldn't have to --
- 11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So this is
- 12 correct mistakes that were made by the
- 13 county with the STAR exemptions or by the
- 14 state --
- MR. VALENTINO: Some were made by
- 16 the state. As you know, there was a new
- income ceiling placed on the STAR exemption
- 18 for all property owners. All property
- 19 owners who primarily reside on their
- 20 property, their income cannot exceed half a
- 21 \$1,000,000. If it does, they're no longer
- 22 entitled to the exemption.
- The problem assessment had was,
- 24 some of the properties were indeed
- 25 underneath that ceiling and they were

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 entitled to the exemption. So the state
- 3 committed an error.
- 4 We then go through the correction
- 5 of error process and the homeowner receives
- 6 the STAR exemption and the state picks up
- 7 the bill.
- 8 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Okay. So
- 9 we're okaying the county paying it until the
- 10 state pays us back?
- 11 MR. VALENTINO: We okay it. We
- 12 pay it out in the first instance and then we
- 13 bill it out to the school district the
- 14 following year. The school district then
- 15 pays us back and the school district seeks
- 16 reimbursement from the state. That's the
- 17 way the law is drafted and that's --
- 18 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: And how
- 19 come we've never done this before?
- 20 MR. VALENTINO: There is another
- 21 provision in the admin code, a correction of
- 22 error provision, and correction of errors
- 23 were handled pursuant to that, Section 559
- 24 of RPTL preempts that provision, and we
- 25 didn't know definitively until a decision

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 was handed down in 2010 in the Town of North
- 3 Hempstead versus Nassau County case, and
- 4 that case wasn't finally appealed -- settled
- 5 until 2011.
- 6 So we are going to do that in
- 7 conjunction with the repeal of the county
- 8 quaranty and tax certiorari refunds. This
- 9 way we can let the school districts know all
- 10 at once and say, hey, be prepared. You're
- 11 going to now be responsible for your pro
- 12 rata share of the refund and budget
- 13 accordingly.
- 14 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So we're
- 15 going to tell the school at the same time
- 16 that they have to handle the refunds and
- 17 they also have to pay us for any SCAR that
- 18 didn't come in on time because of a mistake?
- 19 I'm sorry, not a SCAR, a STAR reduction that
- 20 didn't come in last year because of a
- 21 mistake?
- 22 MR. VALENTINO: Well, they can
- 23 seek reimbursement from the state for the
- 24 STAR exemption.
- 25 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: And we

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 can't?
- MR. VALENTINO: We can't.
- 4 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Right.
- 5 But it was our mistake that may have caused
- 6 it?
- 7 MR. VALENTINO: It was not our
- 8 mistake. It was the state's mistake in
- 9 sending us the properties and saying that
- 10 according to the tax returns they filed, it
- 11 was over the \$500,000 ceiling. And, in some
- 12 instances, for some reason they imputed
- income to the new owner.
- 14 When the new owner purchased the
- 15 house, the state imputed the sale price of
- 16 the house to the new owner and that put the
- 17 new owner over.
- The new owner comes in and says I
- 19 have my tax returns that were filed, I'm
- 20 clearly underneath it. We do a correction
- 21 of error petition. It's approved by the
- 22 leg, assuming it's approved. The leg then
- 23 pays out the refund, bills it out to the
- 24 school districts. The school district, you
- 25 have to budget next year to pay us back for

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 the refund we just paid.
- 3 The school district then pays us
- 4 back once we send them a bill and they can
- 5 seek reimbursement from the state.
- 6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: If the
- 7 state determined -- only the state
- 8 determines that someone was over the 500,000
- 9 because, if you look at the law, that's
- 10 based on their return, their income tax
- 11 return. So the state would decide that
- 12 someone's over 500,000 and doesn't qualify
- 13 for STAR.
- 14 If someone says the state then
- 15 made that mistake, you're saying that the
- 16 county has to then pay that money?
- MR. VALENTINO: That's correct.
- 18 But the county bills it out to the school
- 19 district who reimburses the county and then
- 20 the school district gets reimbursed from the
- 21 state.
- 22 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Maybe.
- 23 Maybe. And I don't even see it in the state
- 24 law why the county would have to lay out the
- 25 money. You're saying that in Suffolk the

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 towns have to lay out the money?
- MR. VALENTINO: It's in RPTL,
- 4 Section 556. I referred to it I believe in
- 5 the opinion. I believe it's Subsection 5,
- 6 paragraph B.
- 7 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So are you
- 8 telling me in other areas like Suffolk,
- 9 right next door, the towns would have to pay
- 10 for the State's mistake?
- MR. VALENTINO: That's correct.
- 12 That's how it's administered in the rest of
- 13 the state.
- 14 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I
- 15 disagree, but okay.
- 16 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Legislator
- Bosworth.
- 18 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: So as
- 19 you're talking about all these things, what
- 20 I'm hearing is, shift, shift, shift.
- 21 So it would seem we've eliminated
- 22 the county guaranty, so that is shifted to
- 23 the school district.
- Now we're talking about this
- 25 error in STAR. It's easy to say that's

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 shifted to the school district, but the
- 3 school district actually has that expense to
- 4 pay. They're going to have to hire
- 5 administrators to administer this.
- It's a whole other level that
- 7 we're asking our school districts that are
- 8 under tremendous pressure to keep their
- 9 budgets down and certainly the residents
- 10 would want their school taxes to stay down.
- 11 We're doing one thing after another that's
- 12 requiring them to become encumbered with
- 13 more administrative responsibilities.
- I know it's not your fault, but
- 15 I'm listening to this, and I'm just very
- 16 very concerned about how much we can expect
- 17 to consistently shift to the school
- 18 districts. They're all our taxpayers. So
- 19 someone's paying -- they're paying for it,
- 20 whether they're paying for it through the
- 21 county, through the town, through the state,
- 22 through the school district, but we're
- 23 constantly shifting the responsibility to
- 24 the local school district, and I have great
- 25 concern about that.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: What Mr.
- 3 Valentino is telling you though is, it's not
- 4 that it's a policy of the Department of
- 5 Assessment, it's the law of the State of New
- 6 York.
- 7 So you may find it objectionable,
- 8 but if the law is what he says it is, then
- 9 we have to do it, number one.
- 10 Number two, you're not going to
- 11 have to hire any administrators in the
- 12 school districts. It's simply their
- 13 existing business offices will be able to
- 14 budget the charge-backs of the county as
- 15 well as the refunds coming in from the
- 16 state. It's just a matter of a year or two
- 17 getting this into the system.
- MR. VALENTINO: We're just
- 19 aligning ourselves with the rest of the
- 20 state. It's not really a shift, it's just
- 21 how the law is written and how Nassau County
- 22 should be operating.
- 23 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: I
- 24 understand that. But having been part of a
- 25 school district for many years, as you know,

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 you can expect administrators to keep taking
- 3 on more and more responsibilities, but at
- 4 some point it does have a fiscal impact.
- 5 It's not our fault, but I just had to
- 6 express my concern.
- 7 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Legislator
- 8 DeRiggi-Whitton.
- 9 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: How
- 10 long has that law been in place?
- MR. VALENTINO: Which law?
- 12 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: The
- 13 law stating that the county has to basically
- 14 bill the school system for this refund.
- 15 MR. VALENTINO: RPTL Section 556,
- 16 since 1979. I believe it was enacted in
- 17 '78.
- 18 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: And
- 19 we have never put it into effect until now?
- MR. VALENTINO: Well, we had our
- 21 own provision in the admin code that
- 22 differed from the RPTL Section 556. It
- 23 wasn't until we had an Appellate Division
- 24 decision handed down that says RPTL Section
- 25 559 states that the correction of error

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 provisions are preempted in the admin code,
- 3 that we knew definitively that we should be
- 4 abiding by RPTL Section 556.
- 5 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: When
- 6 was that?
- 7 MR. VALENTINO: The Appellate
- 8 Division Second Department decided in 2010
- 9 that appeals weren't finished and concluded
- 10 until 2011, in the Court of Appeals. The
- 11 Court of Appeals denied leave to appeal.
- 12 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I
- 13 understand the STAR program is part of that.
- 14 What other errors are we going to now be
- 15 holding the schools accountable for?
- 16 MR. VALENTINO: It would be every
- 17 error that falls under RPTL Section 550.
- 18 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So
- 19 what is your advice as to what they should
- 20 budget, the school districts should budget
- 21 for this type of thing?
- 22 MR. VALENTINO: Well, they're
- 23 going to be informed by us the correction of
- 24 error provisions that were approved. The
- 25 total amount of the correction of error

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 petitions and to increase their budget the
- 3 following year to account for them.
- 4 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:
- 5 Well, they have a two percent gap as well.
- 6 MR. VALENTINO: There are certain
- 7 exceptions to the two percent gap.
- 8 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So
- 9 this is going to fall under those
- 10 exceptions?
- 11 MR. VALENTINO: I can't state
- 12 that definitively.
- 13 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:
- 14 That's what I was thinking. That's probably
- 15 the only way that it's going to go around
- 16 the two percent cap to cover our errors.
- 17 Can I ask one other question? It
- 18 might be slightly hypothetical. The county
- 19 is going to send out these bills to the
- 20 school district, to school districts
- 21 throughout the county. They are, let's say,
- 22 possibly going to get partially reimbursed
- 23 from the state at some point, we can't
- 24 guarantee that, that's for sure.
- However, what are we going to do?

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 What system are we going to have in place
- 3 should the school system not be able to pay
- 4 us? How are we going to go after our
- 5 schools?
- 6 MR. VALENTINO: That's getting
- 7 into a whole other area of law. It becomes
- 8 debtor/creditor and we would be going into
- 9 new territory there, so it's hard -- unless
- 10 I have a concrete fact pattern presented to
- 11 me, and time to research the issue, I really
- 12 can't say.
- 13 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:
- 14 Well, how can we be sending out bills
- 15 without -- I would think it's part of our
- 16 process before we send out bills, we better
- 17 have a clear --
- MR. VALENTINO: It's clear under
- 19 the Real Property Tax Law, but you're
- 20 stating the instance where the school
- 21 district is refusing to pay, or --
- 22 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: Or
- 23 can't pay.
- MR. VALENTINO: Or can't pay.
- 25 You're going to have to go under other

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 provisions then to collect and enforce. I'm
- 3 just telling you how the Real Property Tax
- 4 Law operates and how it's supposed to be
- 5 charged back.
- 6 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So
- 7 how are we going to -- hypothetically or
- 8 not, we need to have a plan right now before
- 9 this goes through.
- 10 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: We'll bring
- 11 them to court. I mean, that's the way
- 12 things work.
- 13 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So
- 14 we're going to be bringing our school
- 15 districts to court?
- 16 MR. VALENTINO: I mean, hopefully
- 17 not. The rest of the state operates this
- 18 way, we can obviously coordinate with other
- 19 assessing jurisdictions and taxing
- 20 jurisdictions to figure out how they handle
- 21 it.
- But we're, hopefully in the first
- 23 instance, the school district abides by the
- 24 law and pays out their pro rata share of the
- 25 refund.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: The towns
- 3 in Suffolk don't charge the schools, they
- 4 just don't.
- 5 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Did
- 6 Legislator Denenberg say he wanted to be
- 7 recognized? Did somebody hear that? Does
- 8 anybody over here have any questions?
- 9 Legislator Denenberg.
- 10 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Sorry.
- 11 The towns in Suffolk have never charged the
- 12 schools for a mistake in an exemption.
- MR. VALENTINO: Then they're not
- 14 abiding by RPTL Section 556. I can't really
- 15 speak to what the towns out in Suffolk do,
- 16 but they should be under that provision.
- 17 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: And if the
- 18 mistake is the county's, the state is going
- 19 to reimburse?
- 20 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Again, we're
- 21 going around in circles. He told you that
- 22 with the STAR exemptions, the mistake is the
- 23 part of the state --
- 24 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: No. He
- 25 said both. It could be either he said.

- 2 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: With the
- 3 STAR exemptions, who makes the mistake that
- 4 results in an inappropriate STAR exemption?
- 5 MR. VALENTINO: Nine times out of
- 6 ten it's the income over and we're then
- 7 doing correction of error petition to
- 8 correct that.
- 9 There are instances where the
- 10 STAR exemption, for one reason or another,
- 11 there was an error made in inputting it, and
- 12 then we have to put it on. It's supposed to
- 13 billed out to the school district. The
- 14 school district gets reimbursed from the
- 15 state or anything dealing with STAR.
- 16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Even if
- it's the county's error?
- MR. VALENTINO: Even if it's the
- 19 county's error.
- 20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Okay. I
- 21 still don't agree and I certainly have
- 22 looked into this since this came up. The
- 23 towns which handle the assessment in Suffolk
- 24 County have not been charging the schools,
- 25 period.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 MR. VALENTINO: So the towns
- 3 haven't been getting reimbursed.
- 4 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Maybe they
- 5 don't have as much of a problem with errors
- 6 or maybe it's because they have a tax cert
- 7 line on the following year's tax bill so
- 8 that corrects it, but they don't charge the
- 9 schools.
- 10 MR. VALENTINO: I really can't
- 11 speak to what they do.
- 12 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Any further
- 13 questions?
- 14 (No verbal response.)
- 15 Thank you, Mr. Valentino. Is
- 16 there any public comment?
- MR. IKENSON: We've been going
- 18 around in circles and this is a typical
- 19 bureaucrat -- nobody mentioned the homeowner
- 20 is going to have to pay the tax.
- 21 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Can you give
- 22 us your name and address for the record?
- 23 MR. IKENSON: The bottom line is,
- 24 the county --
- 25 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Can you give

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 us your name and address for the record?
- 3 MR. IKENSON: The county is going
- 4 to get to the homeowner. What is the bottom
- 5 line?
- 6 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: What is your
- 7 name, sir?
- 8 MR. IKENSON: Seymour Ikenson.
- 9 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Where do you
- 10 live?
- 11 MR. IKENSON: I live in Great
- 12 Neck. I live in an apartment. I don't want
- 13 to own a home. People are moving out of
- 14 Great Neck. Not really that much because
- 15 foreign groups are coming in and buying into
- 16 Great Neck because of the school system.
- 17 But the bottom line is, there is
- 18 no future for young people in Nassau or this
- 19 nation. None of you can tell me when the
- 20 City of New York was going bankrupt, what
- 21 the budget was for the city, And what the
- 22 budget was for the state and what the
- 23 budgets are now. Can anybody tell me that?
- 24 Well, I'll tell you. The budget
- 25 was \$6 billion for the city. And for the

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 state, it was between \$13 billion and 16.
- 3 What are they now? This country is
- 4 bankrupt. The state is bankrupt. The city
- 5 is bankrupt. The county is bankrupt. He's
- 6 looking around for more tax money.
- 7 Who made a mistake is not
- 8 important. It's a homeowner that has to
- 9 pay. The consumer is going to have to pay
- 10 for everything.
- 11 This inflation that's coming here
- 12 will nerve be able to be controlled because
- 13 of this kind of thinking. The law, the
- 14 this, the that, that's all BS.
- 15 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: The law?
- 16 MR. IKENSON: The reality.
- 17 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: The law is
- 18 BS?
- MR. IKENSON: I come here 34
- 20 years ago, 40 years ago. Nothing has
- 21 changed. Nothing. It's said. Totally sad,
- 22 because nobody really wants to see reality
- 23 of what's really happening. And no one
- 24 wants to do anything because they all have
- 25 self interests.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- I'm sitting up here and I look
- 3 around and what do I see? I see everybody
- 4 has there own interests here but I don't see
- 5 citizens. I don't see citizens. What does
- 6 that tell you? They're totally ignorant of
- 7 what's going on here. Not only in this
- 8 room, but throughout the entire United
- 9 States. It's happening in the world, in the
- 10 western world. It's not only here.
- 11 But there are solutions. The
- 12 politicians don't want the solutions. And
- 13 the solutions are very simple, because
- 14 they're going to happen no matter what. The
- 15 politicians are stalling for time by
- 16 borrowing and borrowing, and when the credit
- 17 is going to be finished, the collapse will
- 18 take place, and that's going to be the
- 19 solution. People are going to have to do
- 20 what has to be done.
- 21 CLERK MULLER: Your three minutes
- 22 have expired, sir.
- 23 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Okay.
- 24 MR. IKENSON: That's it. But I
- 25 would tell you now --

| 1 | Rules | Committee/12-3-12 |
|---|-------|-------------------|
|   |       |                   |

- 2 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: Can you
- 3 please just wrap up. You have some extra
- 4 time, go ahead.
- 5 MR. IKENSON: That this is a
- 6 three-card Monty game or a game with walnuts
- 7 with a pea underneath, but there is no pea.
- 8 This is total fraud going on.
- 9 CHAIRMAN NICOLELLO: All right.
- 10 Thank you, sir. Mr. Valentino, again, thank
- 11 you for your advice.
- 12 All those in favor signify by
- 13 saying aye.
- 14 (Aye.)
- Any opposed?
- 16 (Nay.)
- 17 Those items pass four to three.
- 18 (Whereupon, the following is the
- 19 continuation of the minutes of the Rules
- 20 Committee, 12-3-12.)
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: May I have
- 22 a motion, please?
- 23 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.
- 24 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.
- 25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by

Rules Committee/12-3-12 1 2 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator Walker. Any additional comment regarding 3 4 697-12? 5 (No verbal response.) 6 Is there any public comment? 7 (No verbal response.) 8 There being none, all those in favor of 697-12 signify by saying aye. 9 10 (Aye.) 11 Any opposed? 12 (No verbal response.) 13 The item carries unanimously. I think this is the end of -- we're going to 14 15 go to Addendum 2, and since we've already 16 suspended the rules, I think we can certainly -- I have to see which one is 17 Addendum 2 now. 18 19 Now, the first item on Addendum 20 2, we're doing each one separately, Item 21 A-43A-12, a resolution authorizing the 22 director of Nassau County Office of 23 Purchasing to award and execute emergency 24 contracts between the County of Nassau

## REGAL REPORTING SERVICE (516) 747-7353

acting on behalf of various county agencies

25

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 and various vendors. May I have a motion,
- 3 please?
- 4 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.
- 5 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Second.
- 6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 7 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator
- 8 Dunne. Mr. May, who is here to speak on
- 9 this item, please?
- 10 MR. MAY: We have Mr. Ken Arnold
- 11 from DPW. Sorry, I apologize, it's Tom
- 12 Delaney from OEM.
- MR. DELANEY: This was A-43.
- 14 This was for a -- to allow Nassau County OEM
- 15 to update our housing mitigation which we
- 16 need in order to secure funding for housing
- 17 mitigation funds that will be available to
- 18 us after appropriations have been made in
- 19 regards to this presidential declaration now
- 20 for Sandy.
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Yes,
- 22 Legislator Jacobs.
- 23 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Just an
- 24 overall question. Can you tell us the terms
- 25 in this particular item, the terms of the

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 contract?
- MR. DELANEY: Well, the housing
- 4 mitigation plan, it's an overarching plan
- 5 for the entire county and for local towns
- 6 and villages within the county.
- 7 It's basically, it's an
- 8 all-hazard plan. It looks at a lot of the
- 9 various risks and things like that that we
- 10 have here and how we plan to address them.
- 11 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: And how long
- 12 is the contract for?
- MR. DELANEY: The contract is
- 14 only going to be for less than a year.
- 15 We've got to get this plan in place very
- 16 quickly.
- 17 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Thank you
- 18 very much.
- MR. DELANEY: By the way, it's
- 20 100 percent -- I shouldn't say, it's 75
- 21 percent grant funded. I expect to do the
- 22 other 25 percent with an in-kind county
- 23 match with the labor costs.
- 24 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: That's fine.
- 25 Thank you very much. You've answered my

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 question.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 4 Wink.
- 5 LEGISLATOR WINK: Hi. Just a
- 6 quick follow-up to that. The actual amount
- 7 of the contract, maximum, is \$159,650; is
- 8 that correct?
- 9 MR. DELANEY: Yes. I don't have
- 10 it right in front of me. I believe that is
- 11 correct what you said. And award is for a
- 12 greater amount because when we did the
- 13 estimate, or when I did the estimate, I
- 14 estimated it to be a little bit higher and
- 15 they gave us more, and we'll re-purpose that
- 16 money and we'll do something else with it
- 17 I'm sure.
- 18 LEGISLATOR WINK: Now, is the
- 19 county, I know the 75 percent FEMA match,
- 20 reimbursement I should say, is the county
- 21 also subject to the state's 12 and a half
- 22 percent match?
- 23 MR. DELANEY: No. This has
- 24 nothing to do with that, sir. This is a
- 25 totally different award that we got.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                     |
|----|---|
| 2  | LEGISLATOR WINK: So this isn't              |
| 3  | Sandy oriented?                             |
| 4  | MR. DELANEY: I put in this                  |
| 5  | request for this award probably nine months |
| 6  | ago at this point and they just gave us the |
| 7  | award three months ago.                     |
| 8  | LEGISLATOR WINK: Who is "they"?             |
| 9  | MR. DELANEY: New York State.                |
| 10 | LEGISLATOR WINK: Okay. Thank                |
| 11 | you very much.                              |
| 12 | MR. DELANEY: You're welcome.                |
| 13 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other             |
| 14 | questions?                                  |
| 15 | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 16 | Is there any public comment?                |
| 17 | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 18 | There being none, all those in              |
| 19 | favor of this item signify by saying aye.   |
| 20 | (Aye.)                                      |
| 21 | Any opposed?                                |
| 22 | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 23 | The motion carries unanimously.             |
| 24 | Thank you. May I waive the reading of the   |
| 25 | items? I just indicate the item number?     |

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 Thank you very much. Item A-43B, motion,
- 3 please.
- 4 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.
- 5 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Second.
- 6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 7 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator
- 8 Dunne. Who is here to speak on this one,
- 9 Mr. May?
- 10 MR. MAY: Now we have Ken Arnold.
- 11 MR. ARNOLD: Ken Arnold, Public
- 12 Works. This is the JC Broderick emergency
- 13 agreement. This is for the assessments of
- 14 the homes impacted by the sanitary sewer
- 15 overflows due to the loss of electrical
- 16 component at the Bay Park Treatment Plant
- 17 and our various pump stations.
- 18 The consultant will be going into
- 19 the homes after a right of entry form is
- 20 signed by the homeowner and assessing the
- 21 amount of damage done to the basements and
- 22 first floors from the sewage and writing up
- 23 a work plan.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Okay. How
- 25 is the contractor procured?

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 MR. ARNOLD: He was selected by
- 3 the department based on his past experience
- 4 on the asbestos and lead abatement work that
- 5 he does for the county. He had people
- 6 available and the qualifications to get the
- 7 job done in an expeditious matter since the
- 8 county executive declared these
- 9 environmental emergencies at these
- 10 properties.
- 11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Would it
- 12 be correct to say that the contracts were
- 13 dually vetted?
- MR. ARNOLD: Yes.
- 15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: And, of
- 16 course, along with the vetting of the
- 17 contractors, the qualifications were also
- 18 assessed?
- MR. ARNOLD: Yes. All his
- 20 qualifications were assessed.
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you
- 22 very much. Any other questions of Mr.
- 23 Arnold? Legislator Jacobs.
- 24 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Just
- 25 wondering what the term of the contract is

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 and for how long, how many years?
- 3 MR. ARNOLD: It's not for years,
- 4 it's for -- I don't have it in front of me
- 5 because it was called up at the last minute,
- 6 I don't have it right in front of me, but I
- 7 believe it's for a number of months. It's
- 8 going to be over I think either by the end
- 9 of March, I believe, or June. Because it's
- 10 an emergency, this is not going up for a
- 11 very long time. We have to get the work
- 12 done. I apologize for not having it in
- 13 front of me.
- 14 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 15 Abrahams.
- 16 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Hey Ken.
- 17 We know that the areas that are closest to
- 18 the treatment plant are obviously impacted,
- 19 East Rockaway and a couple of other areas,
- 20 would this money be spent in Baldwin with
- 21 Barnes Avenue, is this tied into this type
- 22 of --
- 23 MR. ARNOLD: That's correct.
- 24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay. I
- 25 just wanted to make sure of that.

| 1 R | ules C | Committee/ | 12-3-12 |
|-----|--------|------------|---------|
|     |        |            |         |

- 2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other?
- 3 Legislator Wink.
- 4 LEGISLATOR WINK: Ken, we heard
- 5 from the last contract, which is not Sandy
- 6 related, that there was 75 percent match --
- 7 75 percent reimbursement from FEMA. Is this
- 8 one subject to the 12 and a half percent
- 9 reimbursement from the state or no?
- MR. ARNOLD: We'll be applying
- 11 for reimbursement from both the federal
- 12 government and state on this work.
- 13 LEGISLATOR WINK: So we may be
- 14 facing a liability of 12 and a half percent
- of the \$2,000,000 that's being estimated
- 16 here?
- MR. ARNOLD: Possibly, yes.
- 18 LEGISLATOR WINK: And two million
- 19 is the high end, is that --
- MR. ARNOLD: Based on our initial
- 21 assessments of the number of homes we expect
- 22 to hear from this on this type of damage.
- 23 LEGISLATOR WINK: Okay. Do we
- 24 have estimates on how many homes it was?
- MR. ARNOLD: I don't have it in

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                     |
|----|---|
| 2  | front of me. We have a call-in center. I    |
| 3  | believe the estimates are probably on the   |
| 4  | high side right now how many we're going to |
| 5  | get. But I can get back that information    |
| 6  | for you.                                    |
| 7  | LEGISLATOR WINK: If you could,              |
| 8  | I'd appreciate it. Thanks, Ken.             |
| 9  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other             |
| 10 | comments?                                   |
| 11 | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 12 | Is there any public comment?                |
| 13 | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 14 | There being none, all those in              |
| 15 | favor signify by saying aye.                |
| 16 | (Aye.)                                      |
| 17 | Any opposed?                                |
| 18 | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 19 | The motion carries unanimously.             |
| 20 | The next item is A-43-C. Motion, please.    |
| 21 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.                |
| 22 | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.                   |
| 23 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by              |
| 24 | Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator   |
| 25 | Kopel. Mr. Arnold, you're on again.         |

- 2 MR. ARNOLD: Okay. This is the
- 3 branch contract. This is for the actual
- 4 physical work to remediate the homes
- 5 impacted by the sanitary sewage overflows.
- 6 This contract was prequalified based on work
- 7 he's done for the county on asbestos and
- 8 lead abatement also. He will physically be
- 9 taking contaminated material and remediating
- 10 the homes based on the JC Broderick
- 11 assessment reports.
- 12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any
- 13 questions of Mr. Arnold? Legislator Kopel.
- 14 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: What about
- insurance company reimbursements, are we
- 16 going to --
- 17 MR. ARNOLD: The right of entry
- 18 forms state that they have to notify us of
- 19 any reimbursement they receive and that will
- 20 be worked out as part of the payment to the
- 21 contract and -- we're very careful not to
- 22 have the homeowner receive insurance and
- 23 then we're paying out for this cleanup. So
- 24 that's part of the right of entry form that
- 25 each homeowner is signing.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And we'll do               |
| 3  | this irrespective of financial ability and   |
| 4  | so forth?                                    |
| 5  | MR. ARNOLD: Correct.                         |
| 6  | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And that's all             |
| 7  | reimbursable even if it's a mansion?         |
| 8  | MR. ARNOLD: That's what we                   |
| 9  | anticipate, yes.                             |
| 10 | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Okay.                      |
| 11 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other              |
| 12 | questions from the legislators? Legislator   |
| 13 | Wink.  |
| 14 | LEGISLATOR WINK: Ken, you were               |
| 15 | talking about the remediation. What kind of  |
| 16 | remediation takes place under this contract? |
| 17 | MR. ARNOLD: Removal of                       |
| 18 | contaminated material, disinfection of the   |
| 19 | walls and foundations of the inside of the   |
| 20 | homes and we're taking everything down to    |

22 LEGISLATOR WINK: So personal

studs and then disinfecting the studs.

21

23 property is not part of this contract?

MR. ARNOLD: If it's in the house

25 it's going to get removed with everything

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 else.
- 3 LEGISLATOR WINK: It will be
- 4 removed?
- MR. ARNOLD: Removed.
- 6 LEGISLATOR WINK: But not
- 7 remediated?
- MR. ARNOLD: No.
- 9 LEGISLATOR WINK: Okay. Thanks.
- 10 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I just have
- 11 one followup.
- 12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 13 Jacobs.
- 14 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Yes. Ken,
- 15 again, what is the term of this contract,
- 16 for how many --
- 17 MR. ARNOLD: It might be slightly
- 18 lower than the JC Broderick contract because
- 19 it involves the physical work. Again, I've
- 20 got to get back to you on the exact terms.
- 21 I didn't bring it with me.
- 22 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: But you think
- 23 a year?
- MR. ARNOLD: Less than a year.
- 25 All this will be done in less than a year.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                  |
|----|--|
| 2  | Something I think June is what jumps out |
| 3  | at me. I have to go back.                |
| 4  | LEGISLATOR JACOBS: You don't             |
| 5  | have to be that exact. I just wanted to  |
| 6  | see. Okay. Thank you very much.          |
| 7  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other          |
| 8  | comments?                                |
| 9  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other          |
| 10 | comments from the legislators?           |
| 11 | (No verbal response.)                    |
| 12 | Is there any public comment?             |
| 13 | (No verbal response.)                    |
| 14 | There being none, all those in           |
| 15 | favor signify by saying aye.             |
| 16 | (Aye.)                                   |
| 17 | Any opposed?                             |
| 18 | (No verbal response.)                    |
| 19 | The motion carries unanimously.          |
| 20 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The next           |
| 21 | item is A-43-D. May I have a motion,     |
| 22 | please?                                  |
| 23 | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.              |
| 24 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.               |

CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by

25

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator
- 3 Walker. Who do we have before us?
- 4 MR. MILLET: Rich Millet, Nassau
- 5 County Public Works.
- 6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Welcome,
- 7 Rich. Tell us about this contract and I
- 8 have several questions for you.
- 9 MR. MILLET: Looks Great Services
- 10 was a prerecommended, federal debris
- 11 management company that was entered into the
- 12 debris management plan that Nassau County
- 13 assembled on 3-9-09. They were one of four
- 14 contractors. It's basically set up like a
- 15 requirements contract.
- 16 So when an event occurs, you
- 17 would call the four recommended by the
- 18 federal government, whoever can mobilize the
- 19 equipment at the pricing inside the debris
- 20 management plan, then gets executed.
- 21 Looks Great Services, the very
- 22 first time they were used, was on 8-26-2011
- 23 for Irene. The next time they were used on
- the contract was on 10-29-2012.
- 25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I have

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 several questions. First of all, what is
- 3 the length of this contract?
- 4 MR. MILLET: This contract runs
- 5 for -- the debris management plan is good
- 6 until 2016.
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Is it
- 8 subject to renewal?
- 9 MR. MILLET: We could renew it.
- 10 There's a clause in there, but that would be
- 11 something we'd look at at the time.
- 12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Will it
- 13 come back to the legislature to be renewed?
- MR. MILLET: I don't believe it
- 15 has to. It's not a contract that's active
- 16 all the time. It's in your debris -- when
- 17 the county put together their debris
- 18 management plan in 2009, there had to be
- 19 identified several contractors who would do
- 20 this work.
- 21 Any of those four contractors
- 22 that were given to the county are contacted
- 23 any time there's an emergency coming.
- 24 They're surveyed as to, can you supply the
- 25 items we need, the men we need in the time

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 frame we need it.
- From there, they're then
- 4 activated. It just so happens that Looks
- 5 Great Services is a local company from
- 6 Huntington with a very large group of
- 7 workers and equipment.
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Richard,
- 9 in the event and, God forbid, we have
- 10 another emergency and hopefully not so,
- 11 would you have to come back to us for
- 12 additional revenues?
- MR. MILLET: We have to come back
- 14 every time we would come for revenues, yes.
- 15 Because it's not funded. It's a
- 16 requirement's contract that has no funding.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: In the
- 18 event of another emergency, will we have to
- 19 put in for another capacity to come back for
- 20 additional funding?
- MR. MILLET: Yes. You couldn't
- 22 take the money from Sandy and move it to
- 23 another event. It would be each individual
- 24 event is funded on its own.
- 25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now who

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 controls those funds?
- 3 MR. MILLET: Well, the funds are
- 4 put through budget through appropriations
- 5 and coding, and it's billed like a regular
- 6 requirement's contract through invoicing.
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now there
- 8 is an enormous amount of money allocated to
- 9 this contract. How is that amount selected?
- 10 A. It's basically an estimate you
- 11 have to do on a cubic yard unit pricing. So
- 12 I'll just -- and you probably all know this.
- 13 In the beginning of a storm, you typically
- 14 get 70 hours of what they call time and
- 15 material. So then you're paying an hourly
- 16 rate and equipment through a contractor.
- 17 After 70 hours, this year it was 100, they
- 18 extended it to 100 hours, you then have to
- 19 go to what they call unit pricing, so it's
- 20 cradle to grave. Tree number one is bad,
- 21 it's four feet around. They measure it.
- 22 There's a price to cut it down, a price to
- 23 pick it up and bring it to the dump, a price
- 24 to grind it, hall it and dump it. It all
- 25 goes into a cubic yard formula. So

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 everything is paid for in a cubic yard.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: And that's
- 4 all itemized in the contract?
- 5 MR. MILLET: All in the contract.
- 6 Actually, it's in the back pages of the
- 7 presentation.
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: And, in
- 9 fact, I believe that is on page nine. Could
- 10 you give us a scope of the services that are
- 11 provided by this contractor?
- 12 MR. MILLET: Looks Great Services
- 13 provides not only vegetation removal,
- 14 reduction, and disposal, but they also do
- 15 C&D, household goods, construction debris,
- 16 the same way, removal, disposal. Cradle to
- 17 grave.
- 18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now since
- 19 they have been contractor with the county
- 20 since last year, since Irene, where have the
- 21 services of this contractor been provided?
- 22 MR. MILLET: Looks Great Services
- 23 worked Irene. When Irene was over, their
- 24 contract basically comes to a void, it's no
- 25 longer active. So we don't use them for

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 anything until there's another emergency.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Were there
- 4 any specific areas that the contractor was
- 5 used?
- 6 MR. MILLET: Everywhere. There
- 7 was no construction debris in Irene. It was
- 8 all vegetative.
- 9 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now
- 10 there's two more questions and I'll turn it
- 11 over. I believe you said in your opening
- 12 remarks that we will be reimbursed by the
- 13 federal state entities.
- 14 MR. MILLET: Yes. FEMA has a 75
- 15 percent reimbursement, the state will
- 16 usually do a 12 percent. Last year with
- 17 this contractor, we actually got 100 percent
- 18 back in Irene because the system that they
- 19 use and the monitoring that we have was very
- 20 efficient. So we ended up getting 100
- 21 percent back last year.
- 22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: How much
- 23 of this contract has been awarded to or has
- 24 been paid out to the contract as of this
- 25 date?

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 MR. MILLET: I don't think we've
- 3 paid any invoice yet.
- 4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: None at
- 5 all?
- 6 MR. MILLET: On this at all. We
- 7 received 13 million in billing, but we
- 8 haven't paid any of the invoice yet.
- 9 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'm trying
- 10 to think if there's anything else. By the
- 11 way, hopefully the contract is available to
- 12 all of you. I don't know if you received it
- 13 today.
- Now, any other questions are Mr.
- 15 Millet? Legislator Jacobs.
- 16 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Hi. I want
- 17 to ask you a question. I know this is sort
- 18 of a blind area for most average people, so
- 19 what -- this has to be something that's
- 20 really a lot of trust doing a contract like
- 21 this.
- 22 I was asking -- it was
- 23 intentional that I wanted to know what the
- 24 terms were in the other emergency items we
- 25 just passed, but this one is for five years,

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 and it's \$20,000,000.
- 3 MR. MILLET: Well, it's
- 4 \$20,000,000 for this event.
- 5 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: It's 20
- 6 million for this event?
- 7 MR. MILLET: Again, an estimate.
- 8 It could be more than 20 million by the time
- 9 we're done. It could be underneath. We're
- 10 estimating it at 20 million.
- 11 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Now, correct
- 12 me where I'm going wrong, because I don't
- 13 know. But you can't spend more than 20
- 14 million without coming back?
- 15 MR. MILLET: We have to come back
- 16 to you and again say we had these issues
- 17 that occurred and this had to be taken care
- 18 of and we need to do this, we need this much
- 19 more money, yes.
- 20 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Now let me
- 21 ask you another question, why do you need
- 22 five years? If you're telling me there's
- 23 \$13 million in bills already, I'm almost
- 24 answering my own question, but five years
- 25 seems like an inordinate amount of time even

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 for Sandy. Don't you think --
- 3 MR. MILLET: Again, it's not that
- 4 Sandy goes for five years. The selection of
- 5 Looks Great Services was put in five years.
- 6 If we don't want to use them after this
- 7 storm, we don't have to. We can go back and
- 8 go back to four other contractors and pick
- 9 someone who suits us better if they have it.
- 10 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: So, in other
- 11 words, the 20 million is what's before us as
- 12 an item of money or an amount of money for
- 13 this particular service?
- MR. MILLET: Correct. This one.
- 15 Sandy.
- 16 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: And we chose,
- 17 obviously the county chose this group,
- 18 they're one of the four that they have on
- 19 call to call?
- MR. MILLET: Right. They can
- 21 provide everything we needed. They could
- 22 provide C&D removal, they could provide
- 23 vegetative removal. They provided the
- 24 things we needed in the volume that we
- 25 needed it.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: So let me ask
- 3 you a question as a legislator just so you
- 4 understand what we go through. So forget
- 5 this company. Actually, I've heard some
- 6 good things about this company, so I'm not
- 7 even going to discuss the company.
- 8 It's just such a blind item
- 9 right. People see their wonderful trees and
- 10 I'm one of those people going down wherever
- 11 they exist. People call legislators and
- 12 say, why? Why did 50 trees have to go down?
- When they go out to cut down
- 14 trees, is there an arborist with them?
- 15 MR. MILLET: There is a landscape
- 16 architect and an arborist on all the tree
- 17 climbing crews.
- 18 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: There's two
- 19 good questions behind me. Number one, are
- they county employees?
- 21 MR. MILLET: The landscape
- 22 architects are either county employees or
- 23 consultants from firms that we have hired.
- 24 They do not belong to Looks Great. Looks
- 25 Great does not do the assessment.

| Raich Committeechia 5 12 | 1 | Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|--------------------------|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|
|--------------------------|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|

- The four county, either landscape
- 3 architects that we have, two of them, or two
- 4 from firms that we hire, local firms, they
- 5 do the assessment of the tree.
- 6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: And the
- 7 arborist?
- 8 MR. MILLET: The arborist is
- 9 there in case it's a climbing situation and
- 10 there's another tree and any kind of
- 11 scenario they have to deal with up in the
- 12 tree, the arborist will deal with that. But
- 13 it's only in the tree that is identified by
- 14 the assessment team.
- 15 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Now I am
- 16 going to get to one last question then I'm
- 17 going to turn it over.
- 18 So when you decide trees are
- 19 going to come down, and I don't mean that in
- 20 a bad way, because I know so many trees came
- 21 down on their own, to tell you the truth, I
- 22 assume they removed those trees too, right?
- 23 MR. MILLET: Absolutely.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: How do you
- 25 decide to go into, let's say, park land, how

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 do you go into preserves? How do you make a
- 3 determination that you're needed there?
- 4 In other words, I can understand
- 5 where I live, Plainview and Syosset, forget
- 6 Long Beach, nothing was hit like that, but
- 7 if you read the papers throughout the whole
- 8 thing, Plainview and Syosset were decimated
- 9 with the winds and the trees.
- I can see the trees. I knew they
- 11 had to be removed. I knew they were bending
- 12 over even after the storm and they had to
- 13 go. But how do you make that determination
- 14 when they're going in and you're -- let me
- 15 ask you a question, we're paying by the
- 16 tree, right, for them?
- MR. MILLET: We're only paying by
- 18 the tree in the roadway. We're paying time
- 19 and material in the preserves.
- In other words, if they cut one
- 21 tree down in the preserve, they get the same
- 22 amount of money than if they cut 10.
- 23 We had had an error where the
- 24 production team got into a preserve. We
- 25 ended it after the first day. We didn't

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 realize they were there.
- 3 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: So it's time?
- 4 MR. MILLET: Time and material in
- 5 the preserves.
- 6 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: But it's by
- 7 the tree on the roadway?
- MR. MILLET: On a roadway, in a
- 9 drainage area or a storm water basin. It's
- 10 basically production. But we had an error,
- 11 we had a production team that went into a
- 12 preserve. We removed them from the preserve
- 13 and put a time and material team in. That
- 14 happened in one preserve.
- 15 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Well, what
- 16 does that mean when you say you removed
- 17 them?
- MR. MILLET: We took them out and
- 19 put them in the road, and put a time and
- 20 material group in that doesn't get paid by
- 21 the tree.
- 22 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Why were they
- 23 there originally?
- MR. MILLET: They mistakenly went
- 25 into the preserve. They weren't supposed to

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 go into the preserve. They were supposed to
- 3 go into a different park and they went into
- 4 that one because it was on the list that
- 5 their supervisor had. So they were taken
- 6 out after the first day. I spoke with Mayor
- 7 Suozzi about it.
- 8 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I just want
- 9 to clarify a lot of things we were
- 10 discussing before this. Who tells them
- 11 where to go? Who put it on the list?
- MR. MILLET: There's a list for
- 13 every group supervisor of a certain amount
- 14 of tree crews. They had the entire list on
- 15 that group and they went there when they
- 16 weren't supposed to.
- 17 As soon as we got a couple of
- 18 phone call, I sent someone out. The next
- 19 day there was no production team in there.
- 20 There was a time and material team.
- 21 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: But of course
- 22 certain trees came down?
- MR. MILLET: There may have been.
- 24 I have actually sent an arborist up there
- 25 and a landscape architect to make sure that

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 we didn't make any real bad errors there.
- 3 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: And are they
- 4 going to charge us by the tree, that first
- 5 group that went there?
- 6 MR. MILLET: No. Their job went
- 7 to time and material. We changed their
- 8 billing.
- 9 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Okay. I'll
- 10 let some other people speak. Thank you.
- 11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Anyone
- 12 else? Dennis.
- 13 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Just two quick
- 14 things. A woman came up to me yesterday.
- 15 She said she lives in Massapequa and she had
- 16 a company come to her home right away and
- 17 take the trees down in the backyard which
- 18 was bordered by a preserve, and the company
- 19 cut down trees in the preserve and took off.
- So one of our county workers went
- 21 to her and said listen, you got to pay to
- 22 have those trees removed because they're
- 23 you're trees, we know they were yours
- 24 because we can see the stumps and
- 25 everything. You're going to have to pay to

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 get them removed.
- 3 Are you saying now that these
- 4 companies, the company that were taking is
- 5 going to take those trees out and she's not
- 6 going to have to pay to get them removed?
- 7 MR. MILLET: No. If they took
- 8 the trees down and it's their tree, I
- 9 certainly wouldn't want the county to pay to
- 10 remove their tree.
- 11 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Okay. Just
- 12 wanted to make sure of that.
- Two, earlier today we heard about
- 14 143 trees in Glen Cove that were cut down.
- 15 Do we have any --
- 16 MR. MILLET: I don't have a
- 17 number on what it was.
- 18 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Who did the
- 19 work, or --
- 20 MR. MILLET: Looks Great
- 21 Services.
- 22 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: They did that?
- MR. MILLET: Yes.
- 24 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: They did it by
- 25 mistake?

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 MR. MILLET: No. The wrong team
- 3 went in to do the work. The work that was
- 4 done was identified by the landscape
- 5 architect to be done, just the wrong billing
- 6 group went in there. The same work, from my
- 7 understanding, was done that would have been
- 8 done whether they were production or time
- 9 and material.
- 10 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So you were
- 11 here earlier and you heard that there was
- 12 concern about this?
- MR. MILLET: Yes. In fact, I had
- 14 Mr. Arnato speak to Legislator Whitton
- 15 several times about it. I spoke with Mayor
- 16 Suozzi myself several times about it. Well
- 17 aware of it.
- 18 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: You answered
- 19 my questions. Thank you.
- 20 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I have one
- 21 more question.
- 22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Go ahead,
- 23 Legislator Jacobs.
- 24 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: So what's
- 25 disturbing me is that I'm hearing that they

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 were in there for four days prior to the
- 3 stoppage, and there were, approximately, I'm
- 4 not going to say -- I'm not going to throw
- 5 out a figure like I know, I didn't count
- 6 each tree, but it's come to my attention
- 7 there could be upwards of 140 trees that
- 8 were taken down in those four days.
- 9 MR. MILLET: It's easy for me to
- 10 find out. We'll just go to the debris log.
- 11 We electrically track every tree that's
- 12 either down or taken down. So we have an
- 13 electronic monitoring system where they take
- 14 pictures of the trees and the whole bit.
- 15 They come down. They get logged in to the
- 16 site.
- I can get you the number that was
- 18 taken down. I couldn't tell you what it
- 19 was, and if they were in there for two days
- 20 or three days. When I found out about it I
- 21 removed them.
- 22 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I believe
- 23 you. I believe you did. I'll tell you, I'd
- 24 appreciate more information on this if you
- 25 wouldn't mind. All right?

| 1 | Rules | Committee/12-3-12 |
|---|-------|-------------------|
|   |       |                   |

- 2 MR. MILLET: No problem.
- 3 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Thank you.
- 4 I'm sorry.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Hi Rich.
- 6 How are you?
- 7 MR. MILLET: How are you, sir?
- 8 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: The
- 9 extensiveness of the Glen Cove situation I
- 10 think Legislator Jacobs covered quite
- 11 extensively. Let me ask you a question
- 12 because you had mentioned something in your
- initial comments about \$13 million being
- 14 expended so far.
- Then I also want to couple that
- 16 with the fact that you had mentioned in
- 17 March of 2009, there was -- Looks Great was
- 18 selected through a bid process?
- MR. MILLET: No. The county,
- 20 Office of Emergency Management, along with
- 21 advice from public works, from what I
- 22 understand, I wasn't here, created a debris
- 23 management plan in March of 2009. Looks
- 24 Great was one of the four recommended
- 25 federal disaster contractors that were put

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 into the debris management program.
- 3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Who were
- 4 the other three?
- 5 MR. MILLET: I can't remember
- 6 offhand. It was a group from Alabama,
- 7 someone from California, and then another
- 8 person from Maine. I don't remember their
- 9 company name.
- 10 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Looks Great
- 11 is from?
- MR. MILLET: Huntington.
- 13 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Basically
- 14 this plan was devised where we had four
- 15 possibilities?
- MR. MILLET: Yes.
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS:
- 18 Pre-qualified by the --
- 19 MR. MILLET: Federal government
- 20 that you could reach out to when you had an
- 21 emergency situation.
- 22 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: And I'm
- 23 guessing in our emergency situation which
- 24 was Super Storm Sandy, we selected Looks
- 25 Great in this particular --

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 MR. MILLET: We called them and
- 3 told them that we need 30 crews for this.
- 4 We need this many loaders. We need this
- 5 many grinders and they said they can supply
- 6 it. They were then brought in. Previous to
- 7 the storm, which were the only group that
- 8 was actually ready for the storm.
- 9 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So if I'm
- 10 understanding this correctly, since Looks
- 11 Great was selected based on the process in
- 12 2009, is the department still comfortable
- 13 that that process can hold up water in 2012?
- MR. MILLET: Oh, yes.
- 15 Absolutely.
- 16 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So these
- 17 companies are all still reputable?
- MR. MILLET: Yes. All still
- 19 reputable.
- 20 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So was
- 21 there some type of background check to check
- 22 and make sure that these companies haven't
- 23 really done anything damaging to any other
- 24 municipalities in a three-year time frame?
- MR. MILLET: Well, we used them

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 in 2011.
- 3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: We did?
- 4 For Irene?
- 5 MR. MILLET: Yes. We used Looks
- 6 Looks Great Services for Irene, yes.
- 7 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay. So
- 8 we did use them for Irene?
- 9 MR. MILLET: Yes, we did.
- 10 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I'm just
- 11 curious now, in regards to the \$13,000,000
- 12 that has been expended -- so obviously
- 13 they've done an extensive amount of work
- 14 already?
- MR. MILLET: Already.
- 16 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Can you
- 17 tell me the locations or the areas?
- MR. MILLET: I can tell you --
- 19 every road that --
- 20 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: More tied
- 21 to -- because obviously they're doing a lot
- 22 of work in preserves and parks and that kind
- 23 of thing.
- MR. MILLET: Well, first, here's
- 25 the objective when you have debris

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 management. The very first thing you do is
- 3 open your roads up. So that's the 70 or 100
- 4 hour push they call it. You go out and you
- 5 cut everything on the roadside and you push
- 6 it across to the outside of the road.
- 7 That's what the objective is in the very
- 8 beginning, to open the road up and just push
- 9 everything to the side.
- 10 The second time you want to come
- 11 through is when you catch the hangers, the
- 12 leaners, and then bucket trucks with those
- 13 grapples that you've seen, they come up and
- 14 they come up and they pick all the push up,
- 15 and they pick it up, and they drop it in the
- 16 truck and bring it to the dump. They
- 17 continue to follow the cutting route and
- 18 continue to pick up and bring it to the dump
- 19 as the buckets cut.
- 20 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Gotcha.
- 21 All right. So we're saying we could spend
- 22 upwards of 20?
- MR. MILLET: Yes.
- 24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: We've spent
- 25 13 so far. The balance of the 7, that's

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 going -- I mean, I drive down county
- 3 streets, and I still see debris --
- 4 MR. MILLET: Absolutely.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: -- along
- 6 some of the streets, but I don't know if
- 7 that quantifies \$7 million worth of --
- 8 MR. MILLET: We'll get another
- 9 pass, once we make one full pass-through,
- 10 the grapples will take another pass down all
- 11 the county roads.
- 12 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Is any of
- 13 this for areas like preserves, or park land,
- 14 or woodland areas?
- 15 MR. MILLET: Yes. Parks are
- 16 considered inside of our unit price side.
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I mean,
- 18 look, from our standpoint, we want to be
- 19 supportive of everything in regards to Super
- 20 Storm Sandy, but, at the same time, with the
- 21 fact that we don't know we're going to be
- 22 100 percent reimbursed on this, do we know
- 23 that? 75 percent?
- 24 MR. MILLET: Don't know. 75 we
- 25 know we're going to get.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So
- 3 basically the county could be going into
- 4 preserves with the balance of that
- 5 \$7,000,000 and taking down trees which
- 6 probably will fall down or could fall down,
- 7 whatever may be the case, but it's possible
- 8 we won't be reimbursed on that balance?
- 9 MR. MILLET: Well, no. We'll get
- 10 75 percent reimbursement.
- 11 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: What I'm
- 12 trying to say is, I'm looking at it from a
- 13 standpoint there's a 20. 75 percent of the
- 14 20 is 15. We're approaching the 15. So,
- 15 basically, the balance of whatever's left is
- 16 going to be whatever debris we see on county
- 17 roads, which, I mean, I drive down some of
- 18 the major county roads, I see some, but I
- 19 don't know if that quantifies \$7 million in
- 20 debris and tree removal.
- But, more importantly, what I'm
- 22 asking is then, the bulk of that \$7 million
- 23 could be in preserves.
- MR. MILLET: It should be because
- 25 part --

| 1 | Rules | Committee/12-3-12 |  |
|---|-------|-------------------|--|
|   |       |                   |  |

- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: It should
- 3 be.
- 4 MR. MILLET: -- of the debris
- 5 management plan --
- 6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So assuming
- 7 the first 13 was expended and that was
- 8 expended on the priorities, and not saying
- 9 cleaning up the preserves is not a priority,
- 10 I think it's a wholehearted priority, but,
- 11 at the same time, when the county is not
- 12 going to be reimbursed for it, is it wise to
- 13 spend that money now when we can probably
- 14 spread it out over a period of time to make
- 15 sure we do the right thing in those
- 16 preserves, and at that time we may know a
- 17 better mechanism how to pay for it?
- 18 MR. MILLET: I'll just bring up
- 19 one example. It may be a little bit extreme
- 20 but, in the Massapequa Preserve this year,
- 21 someone was hit with a piece of a tree that
- 22 fell that wasn't mitigated in Irene,
- 23 possibly. That's a tremendous liability
- 24 that I'm unwilling to give up right away
- when I know that we're going to get 75

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 percent of every tree we take down, whether
- 3 it's where ever, we're going to get 75
- 4 percent.
- 5 To me, to look at you guys and to
- 6 look at county executive and tell him it's
- 7 okay to open a park or preserve, I'm going
- 8 to be 100 percent sure that it's safe,
- 9 because if something falls and hits
- 10 somebody, it's me who stood up here and told
- 11 you it's fine.
- 12 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: But
- 13 obviously we wouldn't ask you to make that
- 14 100 percent guarantee now.
- 15 MR. MILLET: Basically, if you
- 16 leave the park open and it hasn't been
- 17 hazard mitigated and storm hardened, that's
- 18 what we're doing. We're leaving it in a
- 19 quasi dangerous situation.
- LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: No, no.
- 21 What I'm saying, Rich, is that even after
- 22 that tree removal company Looks Great goes
- 23 in, are they going to be able to guarantee
- 24 that a branch is not going to fall on
- 25 somebody? We couldn't expect you to make

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 that guarantee.
- 3 MR. MILLET: I mean, nobody can
- 4 guarantee, but I can tell you that if we
- 5 didn't go in places that would be a high
- 6 point of litigation I'd have if I was a
- 7 person who went in a preserve and I found
- 8 out that a park preserve was not -- first
- 9 off it was assessed and there was deemed to
- 10 be damaged trees that you didn't take down?
- 11 God forbid it falls.
- 12 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: And I'm not
- 13 saying that we shouldn't spend the money.
- 14 What I'm saying is, we're lumping this into
- 15 the hope of being reimbursed by it for 75
- 16 percent.
- MR. MILLET: Well, it's not a
- 18 hope. We did the same storm hardening with
- 19 Irene. We went into the parks and preserves
- 20 and we got the money back. You're going to
- 21 get the 75 percent back. It's part of your
- 22 management plan to do what they call hazard
- 23 mitigation and storm hardening.
- 24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So you feel
- 25 confident we'll get the --

| 1 | Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|
|   |       |           |                 |

- MR. MILLET: Very confident.
- 3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: -- we
- 4 should get back \$15,000,000 of this 20 if we
- 5 spend the 20?
- 6 MR. MILLET: Very.
- 7 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: That's
- 8 fair. That's the main question I'm driving
- 9 at. Thank you, Rich.
- MR. MILLET: Okay.
- 11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 12 Wink.
- 13 LEGISLATOR WINK: The term of
- 14 this contract is for five years; is that
- 15 right?
- MR. MILLET: Correct.
- 17 LEGISLATOR WINK: Do we
- 18 anticipate that FEMA is going to be
- 19 reimbursing us for the next five years over
- 20 this?
- MR. MILLET: Again, just because
- 22 Looks Great's "requirements contract" goes
- 23 for five years, I plan on being closed out
- 24 with their services by April, March, which
- 25 could be the last time I see a Looks Great

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 bill.
- 3 LEGISLATOR WINK: So then why do
- 4 we stretch it out to five years?
- 5 MR. MILLET: It's not five -- I
- 6 don't know how to explain it. It's an odd
- 7 contract in that it's not -- they don't do
- 8 any work after April when we're done with
- 9 them. They don't do any work.
- 10 If another storm comes or another
- 11 huge event occurs, we could use them or we
- 12 could use one of the other three in the
- 13 mechanism of the debris management plan.
- 14 LEGISLATOR WINK: Well, you could
- 15 also -- okay. That already exists?
- MR. MILLET: Right.
- 17 LEGISLATOR WINK: Or you could
- 18 hire them the same way you're hiring them
- 19 for Sandy?
- MR. MILLET: Which is through the
- 21 debris management plan. That's the
- 22 mechanism before contractors are on there,
- 23 that's the mechanism we used to contact
- 24 Looks Great. Then they get an emergency
- 25 contract, but it references back to all of

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 the qualifications that are in the debris
- 3 management plan which gives you all that
- 4 pricing in the back of this package.
- 5 LEGISLATOR WINK: So, let's say
- 6 next year we have another storm, God forbid,
- 7 God forbid, you're going to come to us with
- 8 another emergency contract like this one?
- 9 MR. MILLET: We could definitely
- 10 come. If there's an emergency like this, we
- 11 will.
- 12 LEGISLATOR WINK: Could?
- MR. MILLET: We will definitely
- 14 come.
- 15 LEGISLATOR WINK: I mean, this
- 16 contract is not going to satisfy for the
- 17 next storm?
- MR. MILLET: No. We come right
- 19 back here. Just like we did for Irene. If
- 20 we activated Irene, and if I didn't have to
- 21 come back for this, I would have come back,
- 22 not have come back, but we have to come back
- 23 every time we activate it. They're dormant
- 24 until we need them. They don't exist. They
- 25 don't make five cents.

I

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                     |
|----|---|
| 2  | LEGISLATOR WINK: I understand               |
| 3  | the concept of the requirements contract. I |
| 4  | understand the concept of that, and I       |
| 5  | understand the nature of the business that  |
| 6  | they're on call and whoever can show up     |
| 7  | shows up.                                   |
| 8  | But this is one of the four                 |
| 9  | companies that we had acknowledged was      |
| 10 | capable of doing the job.                   |
| 11 | MR. MILLET: Correct.                        |
| 12 | LEGISLATOR WINK: Why aren't we              |
| 13 | just using all four of those companies?     |
| 14 | MR. MILLET: Three of the four               |
| 15 | companies couldn't supply the number of men |
| 16 | and materials that we needed at the time we |
| 17 | needed it. They had already been committed  |
| 18 | to other places. The guy from Maine was     |
| 19 | working for Maine and Massachusetts.        |
| 20 | So we went in and found out who             |
| 21 | fit what we needed and that's the group we  |
| 22 | used.                                       |

23 LEGISLATOR WINK: So we sought

for the entirety of the job rather than 24

25 farming it out to the various groups?

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | MR. MILLET: Yes. You have to                 |
| 3  | look at the entirety. If you went out and    |
| 4  | said, you know what, give me eight bucket    |
| 5  | trucks, give me this, and we'll do more, you |
| 6  | wouldn't get another bucket truck, there's   |
| 7  | not one left. We held all the cards. We      |
| 8  | had all the stuff we needed to service the   |
| 9  | county. That's how you have to approach it.  |
| 10 | LEGISLATOR WINK: So by picking               |
| 11 | Looks Great, they committed to providing for |
| 12 | whatever we needed?                          |
| 13 | MR. MILLET: We gave them a list              |
| 14 | of what we wanted. We sat down and created   |
| 15 | a plan and they gave us every piece of       |
| 16 | equipment we asked for. In fact, they        |
| 17 | increased equipment for us once we realized  |
| 18 | the severity of the North Shore.             |
| 19 | LEGISLATOR WINK: Okay. So to                 |
| 20 | the extent that nobody else could do that,   |
| 21 | that's why we went with Looks Great?         |
| 22 | MR. MILLET: You talk to any                  |
| 23 | FEMA/fed rep, and we're the model they're    |
| 24 | pointing at right now. We're the group that  |

25 they're telling everyone else, do it like

| 1 | Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|
|   |       |           |                 |

- 2 they do it.
- 3 LEGISLATOR WINK: I'm still -- I
- 4 mean, I'm still a little bit troubled by the
- 5 idea there's a five year term on this.
- I know you're probably not going
- 7 to use them for Sandy related events past
- 8 March or April, but the fact that it's so
- 9 open ended is what's kind of confusing me
- 10 and troubling me, quite frankly.
- 11 But the list is not -- the list
- 12 is for four contractors. Based on the list
- 13 you have right now, if there was a snowstorm
- 14 next month or something, God forbid --
- MR. MILLET: Well, a snowstorm we
- 16 don't call anybody in.
- 17 LEGISLATOR WINK: You don't?
- MR. MILLET: No. We never call
- 19 in anyone for a snowstorm, ever.
- 20 LEGISLATOR WINK: Even if it
- 21 causes significant --
- MR. MILLET: No.
- 23 LEGISLATOR WINK: -- trees down?
- MR. MILLET: No. Oh, trees down?
- 25 LEGISLATOR WINK: Yes. Trees

| 1 Rules ( | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 | 2 |
|-----------|-----------|---------------|---|
|-----------|-----------|---------------|---|

- 2 down.
- MR. MILLET: We would use our
- 4 regular tree contract that's a regular
- 5 bidded out contract.
- 6 LEGISLATOR WINK: Which is four
- 7 contracts including Looks Great?
- MR. MILLET: No. We have a
- 9 regular tree service contract separate of
- 10 this. That is just for tree trimming or too
- 11 big a tree falls that we can't get.
- 12 LEGISLATOR WINK: Whose on that
- 13 list?
- 14 MR. MILLET: Looks Great
- 15 Services.
- 16 LEGISLATOR WINK: The only one?
- MR. MILLET: They won the bid.
- 18 LEGISLATOR WINK: They won the
- 19 bid. Okay. So that was done as a result a
- 20 bidding process?
- MR. MILLET: Yes.
- 22 LEGISLATOR WINK: Sealed bid?
- 23 MR. MILLET: Sealed bid.
- 24 LEGISLATOR WINK: Okay. All
- 25 right. I mean, I guess I'm trying to just

| 1 | Rules | Committee | /12- | 3 – 12 |
|---|-------|-----------|------|--------|
|   |       |           |      |        |

- 2 get my head around the fact that, you know,
- 3 this is still an open-ended five year deal.
- 4 MR. MILLET: It looks like a big
- 5 long deal, but, in reality, if you break it
- 6 out like an operation person would, it's
- 7 not. It's really --
- 8 LEGISLATOR WINK: I understand
- 9 that, but every other contract that we've
- 10 had before so far is not five years.
- 11 MR. MILLET: But every other
- 12 contract has some money attached to.
- 13 There's no money attached to this till we
- 14 come to you.
- 15 LEGISLATOR WINK: Well, I mean,
- 16 that's the nature of a requirements
- 17 contract. We have an appropriation, but it
- 18 doesn't mean we have to spend it. I get
- 19 that. I get that. And none of these other
- 20 contracts were requirements contracts?
- MR. MILLET: No.
- LEGISLATOR WINK: Okay.
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 24 Walker.
- 25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Just quickly.

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 Actually you said that this contract
- 3 actually began when we --
- 4 MR. MILLET: In 2009.
- 5 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So March of
- 6 2009. And it basically lay dormant. We
- 7 didn't need to use them until Irene
- 8 occurred.
- 9 MR. MILLET: Correct.
- 10 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So then we
- 11 used them for Irene and obviously the damage
- 12 was far less, thank God.
- MR. MILLET: They were done and
- 14 put away.
- 15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Now, again,
- 16 it stayed, you know, vacant, dormant until
- 17 Sandy hit?
- MR. MILLET: Correct.
- 19 LEGISLATOR WALKER: And now this
- is where we are with Sandy?
- MR. MILLET: Correct.
- 22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: And let's
- 23 just hope to God when we finish this with
- 24 Sandy that there are many, many, many, years
- 25 that we go without having to reach out to

| 1 Rules ( | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 | 2 |
|-----------|-----------|---------------|---|
|-----------|-----------|---------------|---|

- 2 anyone.
- MR. MILLET: I'm good with no
- 4 storms. I'm a big fan of no storms right
- 5 now.
- 6 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Irene was a
- 7 remediation project, correct?
- MR. MILLET: Irene we used them
- 9 for tree removal and vegetation. That's
- 10 what they were used for in Irene.
- 11 LEGISLATOR WALKER: And this here
- is for mitigation; is that correct?
- MR. MILLET: No, Irene there was
- 14 hazard mitigation which is, after the storm,
- 15 you have to evaluate all of your critical
- 16 infrastructure, park, whatnot, to see if
- 17 anything's damaged that may fall down, or
- 18 that may hurt somebody, and you have a
- 19 responsibility to take that hazard out. So
- 20 that the next time a storm comes, that tree
- 21 doesn't come down?
- LEGISLATOR WALKER: Right. Okay.
- 23 MR. MILLET: We did that in both
- 24 storms.
- 25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I experienced

| 1 F | Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|-----|-------|-----------|-----------------|
|-----|-------|-----------|-----------------|

- 2 it personally and I know what it means to
- 3 have trees fall and whatever and to have
- 4 them removed, and how difficult it is to get
- 5 someone to do what has to be done. So I'm
- 6 still waiting for the stumps to be grinded
- 7 and I can wait until all hell freezes over
- 8 at this point, but, that's okay. I shall be
- 9 patient as long as no more trees fall down.
- 10 I did engage the services of an
- 11 arborist because I want to know how my other
- 12 trees are going to fair in another storm.
- I thank you really very much for
- 14 the information that you provided to us
- 15 today.
- 16 MR. MILLET: You're welcome very
- much.
- 18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Okay,
- 19 Judy.
- 20 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: First, I want
- 21 to thank you also. You helped us to
- 22 understand a little bit more and understand
- 23 that an error was made at the beginning --
- 24 or I don't even know when that error was
- 25 made. I won't go into that. I'll let you

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 tell us about that.
- MR. MILLET: I'll tell you.
- 4 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Let me ask
- 5 you this though. And I understand from
- 6 being presiding for a lot of years, that
- 7 there are people, there are companies that
- 8 are kept on as being the go-to companies in
- 9 the event of something specific, such as
- 10 this was.
- 11 Do you, in the course of the five
- 12 years, ever go back to check on the --
- MR. MILLET: Yes.
- 14 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: You do?
- MR. MILLET: In fact, in Irene,
- 16 we called all four companies.
- 17 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: But you go
- 18 back -- you have a mechanism to check -- in
- 19 other words, the reason why they were one of
- 20 the four that was put on the list as being
- 21 the affirmative ones to go to --
- 22 MR. MILLET: Right. It was the
- 23 federal government who supplied that list to
- 24 the people with the debris.
- 25 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Do you go --

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 let's say every year and a half or so, do
- 3 you check with the feds and make sure these
- 4 are still the recommended ones?
- 5 MR. MILLET: I mean, if they're
- 6 not, they're usually pretty prompt at
- 7 getting you something that says they're not
- 8 an approved contractor anymore. But I will
- 9 have public works, the roadway people,
- 10 they'll do a yearly update, and we'll go and
- 11 we'll get it.
- 12 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I think that
- 13 would give some more reassurance that
- 14 they're just not automatically called upon
- 15 and, for all we know, they may --
- 16 MR. MILLET: Absolutely. That is
- 17 not an issue.
- 18 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Thank you for
- 19 being patient and for answering.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: At this
- 21 point, is there any public comment? Thank
- 22 you again, Mr. Millet.
- 23 (No verbal response.)
- 24 There being none, all those in
- 25 favor of this item A-43-D, signify by saying

| 1 Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|---------|-----------|-----------------|
|---------|-----------|-----------------|

- 2 aye.
- 3 (Aye.)
- 4 Any opposed?
- 5 (No verbal response.)
- The motion carries unanimously.
- 7 We have A-43-E-12.
- 8 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.
- 9 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 11 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator
- 12 Kopel. Is there anyone here to speak on
- 13 this item?
- MR. MILLET: Rich Millet, public
- 15 works. This is an emergency contract for
- 16 tipping of the chips, the dumping of our
- 17 chips. This is a group we negotiated with
- 18 to get a price of \$7.80 a cubic yard versus
- 19 \$13 and \$27 a cubic yard.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Questions
- 21 of Mr. Millet? Legislator Abrahams.
- 22 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So, Rich,
- 23 this was the lowest, most responsible --
- MR. MILLET: Most responsible.
- 25 He has a DEC approved site. He manages the

f

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                    |
|----|--|
| 2  | chips in soil remediation.                 |
| 3  | LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: And term o            |
| 4  | contract, I'm taking                       |
| 5  | MR. MILLET: I think it's a June            |
| 6  | You're looking at June, but we'll probably |
| 7  | be done by April, hopefully.               |
| 8  | LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay.                 |
| 9  | Thank you.                                 |
| 10 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any                  |
| 11 | questions for Mr. Millet?                  |
| 12 | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 13 | Is there any public comment?               |
| 14 | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 15 | There being none, all those in             |
| 16 | favor of this item signify by saying aye.  |
| 17 | (Aye.)                                     |
| 18 | Any opposed?                               |
| 19 | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 20 | The motion carries unanimously.            |
| 21 | Item A-43-F. May I have a motion, please?  |
| 22 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.               |
| 23 | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.                  |

## REGAL REPORTING SERVICE (516) 747-7353

Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator

CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by

24

25

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 Kopel. Who is here?
- 3 MR. ARNOLD: Ken Arnold. This is
- 4 an emergency contract with Synergro. As
- 5 you're aware, at Bay Park we suffered severe
- 6 damage. One of the buildings that was
- 7 totally under water and is currently out of
- 8 commission is our sludge filter presses.
- 9 This contract with Synergro is to
- 10 bring in rental units, run these units to
- 11 press our sludge so it can be trucked off to
- 12 our beneficial re-use site in Pennsylvania
- 13 and West Virginia.
- 14 The contract term for this I
- 15 believe is one year. We're currently
- 16 evaluating the sludge press building and
- 17 coming up with a remediation plan for that
- 18 building. Synergro was also the same
- 19 company we used for the GBT issue back two
- 20 years ago.
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 22 Kopel.
- 23 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Are they
- 24 actually working at this already as an
- 25 emergency?

| 1 | Rules | Committee/12-3-12 |
|---|-------|-------------------|
|   |       |                   |

- MR. ARNOLD: Yes, they are.
- 3 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: When will
- 4 these things be in place?
- 5 MR. ARNOLD: The temporary rental
- 6 equipment is in place currently.
- 7 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: They're
- 8 working?
- 9 MR. ARNOLD: Yes. They were
- 10 called -- I mean, the initial evaluation at
- 11 the plant the day after the storm, this is
- 12 one of the first areas that we realized we
- 13 had to get some equipment there in a hurry
- 14 knowing that this equipment was going to be
- 15 competed against with other sewage plants
- 16 that saw similar issues.
- 17 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: When do you
- 18 anticipate the permanent can be done?
- MR. ARNOLD: It's hard to say
- 20 right now. Minimum of a year. Possibly two
- 21 years.
- 22 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Will this
- 23 serve as a complete, if only temporary
- 24 solution, but will it serve as a complete --
- 25 MR. ARNOLD: While it is a

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 temporary solution, it is achieving the same
- 3 output that our permanent building achieved.
- 4 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: So that's the
- 5 questions. So, is their plant meeting the
- 6 permits now?
- 7 MR. ARNOLD: Excuse me?
- 8 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Is the plant
- 9 meeting the permits now?
- 10 MR. ARNOLD: Well, on sludge
- 11 de-watering it's not -- sludge de-watering
- 12 is the solids removal from the plant.
- 13 There's no permanent requirement for the
- 14 solids removal. It's other than -- we want
- 15 to press the sludge as much as possible to
- 16 reduce the volume of material that we truck
- 17 for beneficial reuse, and this temporary
- 18 facility is achieving the same number of
- 19 percent solids for the sludge so the weight
- 20 is the same or less than we were doing with
- 21 our permanent facility.
- 22 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: All right. I
- 23 won't go further into the whole Bay Park
- 24 issue at this point. Just confine myself to
- 25 this.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                     |
|----|---|
| 2  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other             |
| 3  | comments from any of the legislators?       |
| 4  | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 5  | I don't see any public, but I               |
| 6  | will ask, is there any public comment?      |
| 7  | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 8  | There being none, all those in              |
| 9  | favor signify by saying aye.                |
| 10 | (Aye.)                                      |
| 11 | Any opposed?                                |
| 12 | (No verbal response.)                       |
| 13 | The motion carries unanimously.             |
| 14 | We have A-43-G. May I have a motion,        |
| 15 | please?                                     |
| 16 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.                |
| 17 | LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.                   |
| 18 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by              |
| 19 | Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator   |
| 20 | Kopel. Mr. Millet, thank you.               |
| 21 | MR. MILLET: Yes. This is a                  |
| 22 | contract for debris hauling that we used in |
| 23 | several villages and towns to help them.    |
| 24 | They were overwhelmed. So we activated a    |
| 25 | contract, Mr. Constanza. We negotiated a 52 |

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                    |
|----|--|
| 2  | cubic yard price from him and executed an  |
| 3  | emergency contract.                        |
| 4  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any                  |
| 5  | questions for Mr. Millet on this item?     |
| 6  | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 7  | Is there any public comment?               |
| 8  | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 9  | There being none, all those in             |
| 10 | favor of this item signify by saying aye.  |
| 11 | (Aye.)                                     |
| 12 | Any opposed?                               |
| 13 | (No verbal response.)                      |
| 14 | The motion carries unanimously.            |
| 15 | One more item. It's E-224-12. May I have a |
| 16 | motion, please?                            |
| 17 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.               |
| 18 | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Second.                  |
| 19 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by             |
| 20 | Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator  |
| 21 | Dunne. Who is here?                        |
| 22 | MR. ARNOLD: Ken Arnold. This is            |
| 23 | a contract with CDM Smith and Liro         |

Engineering. It is to manage and implement

the county's step program, and also

24

25

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 oversight for the sanitary sewer overflow
- 3 remediation that we were doing in the homes
- 4 in Baldwin, East Rockaway and other areas
- 5 that were impacted.
- The consultants are responsible
- 7 on the step program for managing the
- 8 assessments that are being done by the
- 9 contractors, plumber, electricians,
- 10 carpenters, and then they'll be hiring these
- 11 carpenters and plumbers to actually
- 12 implement the temporary measures in the
- 13 homes. They'll be responsible for
- 14 inspecting the work to make sure it is
- 15 installed and running. Another item is,
- 16 they were managing all the interface between
- 17 the towns, the homeowners and the step
- 18 contractors.
- 19 The step contractors were all
- 20 working at unit bid price items through this
- 21 contract. Those contractor price items were
- 22 put out for requests last week on the county
- 23 website. These contractors submitted prices
- 24 and the most qualified contractors with the
- 25 unit prices that fit within the goals of the

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 program are currently selected. It does not
- 3 mean that we would not expend the number of
- 4 contractors if it was needed to get the work
- 5 done for these temporary measures for these
- 6 people that have no heat or electricity in
- 7 their homes at this moment.
- 8 The only difference between the
- 9 step program and the environmental
- 10 remediation for the houses that were
- 11 impacted by sewage overflows is, the
- 12 contractors being used for the sanitary
- 13 sewage overflows, the county entered into
- 14 contract with JC Broderick and Branch that
- 15 came before you earlier. Those would be the
- 16 contractors doing the work under our county
- 17 contract, whereas, the step program, the
- 18 contractors are working for directly Liro
- 19 and CDM Smith.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any
- 21 questions of Mr. Arnold? Legislator
- 22 Abrahams.
- 23 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Hey Ken,
- 24 how are you? Obviously, with a day like
- 25 these last few days where it gets really

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 cold, and the weather, I mean, the fact that
- 3 anybody doesn't have a boiler or hot water
- 4 heater is unconscionable.
- 5 I do have some specific questions
- 6 in regards to how the program works. CDM
- 7 Smith I guess is being selected to provide
- 8 the in-home service, and I guess they've
- 9 been working already since the storm, am I
- 10 understanding that correctly?
- 11 MR. ARNOLD: Yes. Well, what we
- 12 did is, all these emerging conditions is, we
- 13 came before this body about a week or so ago
- 14 with a number of consultant agreements, one
- 15 which was CDM Smith, they had a task to help
- 16 us set up this program in that agreement.
- 17 But that task did not include hiring of
- 18 contractors and inspection work. That's
- 19 what this agreement has in it.
- 20 So there were a number of things
- 21 done early on, I mean, the call center was
- 22 put together. We've been receiving calls
- 23 from people looking for assistance. Their
- 24 assessment teams have been going out
- 25 assessing homes, finding what homes are

| 1 | Rules | Committee | /12- | 3 – 12 |
|---|-------|-----------|------|--------|
|   |       |           |      |        |

- 2 capable and acceptable for the step program.
- 3 A home full of sewage right now
- 4 is not acceptable for the step program, it's
- 5 not livable. The home has to be livable,
- 6 other than having any heat or power. So
- 7 that's where this -- the ultimate goal of
- 8 this program is to get people out of either
- 9 a shelter, a motel, or a family member, and
- 10 get them back into their home.
- 11 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I guess the
- 12 issue is not really with CDM Smith, because
- 13 CDM Smith is coming into the home and
- 14 assessing whether or not --
- 15 MR. ARNOLD: Well, CDM Smith
- 16 themselves don't assess the home, the
- 17 contractors, the plumbers, electricians, the
- 18 trades assess the homes, what is required.
- 19 CDM Smith will verify what the contractors
- 20 are doing.
- 21 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So they're
- 22 like a project manager, I guess?
- 23 MR. ARNOLD: Yes. That's a good
- term, yes.
- 25 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So I quess

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 once they assess, then people are expecting
- 3 their boilers -- what's the time frame for
- 4 them to get a boiler or a hot water heater?
- 5 MR. ARNOLD: Those details are
- 6 still ongoing. I believe today we started
- 7 actually initiating installations of the
- 8 first half a dozen homes.
- 9 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Where are
- 10 we getting these boilers from?
- 11 MR. ARNOLD: The contractor is
- 12 responsible for procuring them. We have
- 13 unit priced --
- 14 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: CDM Smith
- 15 is responsible for that? Whose the
- 16 contractor, I'm sorry?
- MR. ARNOLD: Well, CDM Smith is
- 18 contracting out to electricians, plumbers,
- 19 carpenters who are responsible for the
- 20 implementation of the program which includes
- 21 buying and installing the hot water heater,
- 22 the electrical panel, whatever items are
- 23 required.
- 24 That list of items is not
- 25 extensive. This is a temporary measure. So

|  | L | Rules | Committee | e/12-3-12 |
|--|---|-------|-----------|-----------|
|--|---|-------|-----------|-----------|

- 2 whether it's baseboard heating, if it's a
- 3 hot water heater, it's not -- the intent is
- 4 not to have people live in their homes for
- 5 years after this. It's to get them through
- 6 these rough couple of months while they
- 7 procure contractors to permanently fix their
- 8 homes or utilizing whether it's their
- 9 insurance, FEMA, or whatever other funds
- 10 they may have. This is a bridge gap to get
- 11 people back in their homes.
- 12 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So if
- 13 somebody couldn't wait on the county and
- 14 they had the CDM Smith, I guess, team that
- 15 they contracted with came out, assessed
- 16 their home, but they can't wait on the
- 17 county, their home was assessed two, three
- 18 weeks ago. Obviously last week was a very
- 19 cold week. You walked out, degrees were in
- 20 the 40s, 30 degrees. They decided, you know
- 21 what, I'm going to try to get my own boiler.
- 22 Are their costs reimbursable under this
- 23 program or basically they have to have the
- 24 boiler be, or hot water heater be purchased
- 25 through this program?

- 2 MR. ARNOLD: Remember, it
- 3 wouldn't be a reimbursement because, what
- 4 the homeowner would have done would have
- 5 been a permanent measure for their home.
- 6 This is a temporary quick fix.
- 7 We're talking about putting a 20
- 8 gallon hot water heater in somebody's home
- 9 which is not adequate for the long term
- 10 standing of that home.
- 11 We're not fixing the home that is
- 12 livable permanently. It's a couple of
- 13 baseboards. It's a 20 gallon hot water
- 14 heater. It's an electric panel with enough
- 15 breakers to run the home in a temporary
- 16 measure.
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I
- 18 understand that. Usually when -- and this
- 19 is no-fault of the department, but usually
- when someone expresses the term "temporary,"
- 21 you think that relief is coming a little bit
- 22 quicker to bridge the gap to a permanent
- 23 solution. It just seems like we're not
- 24 being able to bridge the gap between that
- 25 permanent solution and where they were or

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 where they are.
- MR. ARNOLD: This program is a
- 4 joint program with the federal government.
- 5 There had to be guidelines and there was a
- 6 lot of negotiation of what this program was
- 7 working with FEMA.
- 8 FEMA had put together a guidance
- 9 manual on this program. It's the first time
- 10 in the country that something like this has
- 11 been attempted.
- 12 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So do you
- 13 envision the flood gates of trying to be
- 14 able to not only assess these homes CDM, do
- 15 you envision also being able for the
- 16 contractors to get the equipment, even if
- 17 it's a temporary stop gap, do you think that
- 18 most people will be online? I mean, we're
- 19 already in December, will they be able to
- 20 have their homes to be functional to bridge
- 21 the gap through the winter to the spring in
- 22 the immediate future in the next week?
- 23 MR. ARNOLD: Yes. I have not
- 24 heard anybody speak about issues with
- 25 supplying of heaters. CDM Smith and Liro

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 have been doing their due diligence to make
- 3 sure that what we're speccing out exists for
- 4 these contractors to get.
- 5 The last status meeting I did not
- 6 hear any issues that we'd have any other
- 7 hang-ups other than getting their agreements
- 8 signed and all the liability and the
- 9 insurance coverages is done so we can move
- 10 forward.
- 11 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So we
- 12 shouldn't hear any horror stories about
- 13 somebody who had their home assessed two,
- 14 three weeks ago, but they're still without a
- 15 boiler or hot water heater, even a temporary
- 16 situation two weeks from now?
- MR. ARNOLD: I would hope not.
- 18 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Thank you,
- 19 Ken.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 21 Kopel.
- 22 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Really quick,
- 23 I just wanted to follow up on Legislator
- 24 Abraham's questions.
- I've heard that people are having

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 trouble getting anything going, actually.
- 3 You've done the assessments. Is the program
- 4 actually in operation? Have you started
- 5 installing --
- 6 MR. ARNOLD: Starting today, I
- 7 believe a half a dozen homes we've
- 8 contractors in those homes and that will be
- 9 ramped up once this contract gets signed.
- 10 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: What's the
- 11 capacity?
- MR. ARNOLD: I believe we have 40
- 13 contractors that we initially signed up to
- 14 do the work.
- 15 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: 40 contractors
- 16 and they can do --
- 17 MR. ARNOLD: I believe actually
- 18 the contractors might be one of the exhibits
- 19 in the agreement.
- 20 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: They can do
- 21 how many in a day or in a week?
- 22 MR. ARNOLD: I'd have to go back
- 23 and talk to the project manager.
- 24 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And what you
- 25 told Legislator Abrahams is that they have

| 1 Rules ( | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 | 2 |
|-----------|-----------|---------------|---|
|-----------|-----------|---------------|---|

- 2 got the materials all ready to go?
- 3 MR. ARNOLD: The materials with
- 4 the homework that Liro and CDM had done,
- 5 there was nothing mentioned that materials
- 6 would be an issue to get for this program.
- 7 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: How long does
- 8 it take them to get the assessment done?
- 9 MR. ARNOLD: Is probably half
- 10 day.
- 11 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: No, no. From
- 12 the time that somebody asks for it.
- MR. ARNOLD: I believe we were
- 14 getting the assessments done within a day or
- 15 two.
- 16 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And from the
- 17 time of the assessment until the time that
- 18 work might start? Once the contract is
- 19 signed?
- MR. ARNOLD: Yes.
- 21 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Once it's
- 22 signed?
- 23 MR. ARNOLD: We're out there
- 24 today. We begged CDM to start today in
- 25 anticipation of this contract getting

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 signed.
- 3 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: In other
- 4 words, you must have a backlog?
- 5 MR. ARNOLD: Yes, I believe. I
- 6 have to go back to my notes as to how many
- 7 homes are backlogged.
- 8 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: So, in other
- 9 words, if somebody calls today, it might get
- 10 approved in a day or so, a day or two, and
- 11 until they actually get installed, it might
- 12 be --
- MR. ARNOLD: I'd like to go back
- 14 and get those.
- 15 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Because the
- 16 winter is coming.
- MR. ARNOLD: I know.
- 18 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: It's here.
- 19 Well, not today maybe, or tomorrow, but it
- 20 will be here. Could you let us know,
- 21 please?
- MR. ARNOLD: Yes.
- 23 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Thank you.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 25 Dunne has a question.

| 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12 | 1 | Rules | Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|---------------------------|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|
|---------------------------|---|-------|-----------|-----------------|

- 2 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Prevailing
- 3 wage is applied to these contracts.
- 4 MR. ARNOLD: These are union
- 5 contractors, yes.
- 6 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So Local 25
- 7 IBEW, and Local 7 Carpenters are being used
- 8 to --
- 9 MR. ARNOLD: Yes.
- 10 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Or they're
- 11 getting the equal pay as --
- MR. ARNOLD: Yes.
- 13 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Because I get
- 14 calls from them saying they got a lot of
- 15 guys out of work and they really want --
- 16 MR. ARNOLD: I mean, CDM
- 17 negotiated with the building trades council
- 18 to get contractors to come to a table to
- 19 help us with the assessments. We work
- 20 through the local trade councils to get this
- 21 developed.
- 22 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Over the
- 23 weekend, I heard that the electrical panels
- 24 are almost impossible to get. One
- 25 contractor sent down to Maryland to get 40

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- 2 of them, and then the same thing with
- 3 plumbers, they said the boilers are
- 4 impossible to get now. They're sending down
- 5 to Maryland and Virginia to get them. One
- 6 guy brought up 40 and he got three left
- 7 already.
- 8 MR. ARNOLD: The style of hot
- 9 water heater and panel that is insured are
- 10 ones that are for permanent fixes. These
- 11 are all eight panel breakers, and 20 gallon
- 12 water heaters. They're not the ones you'd
- 13 go to rebuild your house. They're just what
- 14 you need to habitate your second floor.
- 15 That's why they're not going to be in
- 16 shortage for the emergency.
- 17 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Thank you.
- 18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 19 Abrahams.
- 20 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Just a
- 21 quick question, Ken, I forgot to ask it
- 22 earlier. Does this grant, this allotment of
- 23 money, does it fall under the guidelines of
- 24 the MWBE?
- 25 MR. ARNOLD: I'd have to go back

- 1 Rules Committee/12-3-12
- and double check how that was procured. I'm
- 3 not sure we did anything special with that
- 4 at this point.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay.
- 6 Because it's an emergency?
- 7 MR. ARNOLD: Yes.
- 8 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I'm just
- 9 curious that -- I know CDM was selected but
- 10 other contractors --
- 11 MR. ARNOLD: Actually, and I
- 12 meant to bring up, we did put out a short
- 13 list to consultant firms to select on this
- 14 one. This was not a strict selection. We
- 15 did RFP this for a short period of time with
- 16 selected firms.
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay. So
- 18 there probably was. Thank you.
- MR. ARNOLD: Kevan, also, Dr.
- 20 Phil Elliot has approached me about
- 21 approaching us with the MWBE for some of
- 22 work moving forward and how we can get
- 23 minority firms involved in some of this
- 24 recovery effort.
- LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay.

| 1  | Rules Committee/12-3-12                      |
|----|--|
| 2  | Thank you.                                   |
| 3  | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,             |
| 4  | Mr. Arnold. I know it's been a long day for  |
| 5  | you and for some others that are sitting out |
| 6  | there as well as ourselves.                  |
| 7  | We need to take a vote. All                  |
| 8  | those in favor of this item signify by       |
| 9  | saying aye.                                  |
| 10 | (Aye.)                                       |
| 11 | Any opposed?                                 |
| 12 | (No verbal response.)                        |
| 13 | The motion carries unanimously.              |
| 14 | At this point I would take a motion to       |
| 15 | adjourn.                                     |
| 16 | LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.                  |
| 17 | LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.                   |
| 18 | CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by               |
| 19 | Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator     |
| 20 | Walker. All those in favor signify by        |
| 21 | saying aye.                                  |
| 22 | (Aye.)                                       |
|    |  |

## REGAL REPORTING SERVICE (516) 747-7353

Thank you, Mr. May. Good job.

(No verbal response.)

Any opposed?

23

24

25

| 1  |           | Rules Committee | / 1 2 - 3 - 1 2 |
|----|-----------|-----------------|-----------------|
| 2  |           | MR. MAY: Thank  | you.            |
| 3  |           | (Whereupon, the | Rules Committee |
| 4  | adjourned | at 5:30 p.m.)   |                 |
| 5  |           |                 |                 |
| 6  |           |                 |                 |
| 7  |           |                 |                 |
| 8  |           |                 |                 |
| 9  |           |                 |                 |
| 10 |           |                 |                 |
| 11 |           |                 |                 |
| 12 |           |                 |                 |
| 13 |           |                 |                 |
| 14 |           |                 |                 |
| 15 |           |                 |                 |
| 16 |           |                 |                 |
| 17 |           |                 |                 |
| 18 |           |                 |                 |
| 19 |           |                 |                 |
| 20 |           |                 |                 |
| 21 |           |                 |                 |
| 22 |           |                 |                 |
| 23 |           |                 |                 |
| 24 |           |                 |                 |
| 25 |           |                 |                 |

| 1  |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
|----|-------|-----|---|----|-----|---|----|-----|-----|-----|---|---|---|-----|----------|-----|---|-----|-----|-----|-----|---|---|-----|-----|-----|----------|-----|---|-----|-----|-----|---|-----|---|
| 2  |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     | (   | 7   | Ε |   | R | 7   | <u> </u> | Ι   |   | F   | I   | -   | С   |   | Α | -   | Г   | E   | <u>:</u> |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 3  |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 4  |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 5  |       |     |   | I  | ,   | F | R. | Α]  | N I | C   | G | R | A | Y,  | ,        | a   |   | Sl  | 1 C | r   | t   | h | a | n ( | d   | R   | 2 e      | g:  | 0 | r   | t،  | er  |   | a n | d |
| 6  | Not   | t a | r | У  | Ρ   | u | b  | 1   | i   | C   | i | n |   | a r | ı d      |     | f | 0 1 | r   | t   | h   | e |   | S t | t a | a t | e        | :   | 0 | f   | ]   | Νe  | W |     |   |
| 7  | You   | r k | , | (  | o f |   | h  | e : | re  | e b | У |   | s | t a | a t      | e   | d | :   |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 8  |       |     |   | ΤI | ΗA  | Т |    | Ι   | ć   | аt  | t | е | n | d e | e d      |     | a | t   | t   | : h | ιе  |   | t | ir  | n e | 3   | а        | n   | d |     | p i | la  | С | е   |   |
| 9  | a b   | v c | е | ľ  | n e | n | t  | i   | o r | ı e | d |   | a | nc  | ſ        | t   | 0 | 0]  | ζ.  | S   | t   | е | n | 0 9 | g 1 | c a | ıρ       | h   | i | С   |     | re  | С | or  | d |
| 10 | οf    | t   | h | е  | р   | r | 0  | C ( | e e | e d | i | n | g | s   | i        | n   | - | t l | າ ∈ | ž   | a   | b | 0 | V   | e - | - e | n        | ιt  | i | t   | 1 0 | e d |   |     |   |
| 11 | mat   | tt  | е | r  | ;   |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 12 |       |     |   | ΤI | ΗA  | Т |    | t]  | h e | 9   | f | 0 | r | e c | g 0      | i   | n | g   | t   | r   | a   | n | s | C I | ri  | Ĺр  | t        |     | i | s   | i   | a   | t | ru  | е |
| 13 | and   | d   | а | C  | c u | r | a  | t ( | е   | t   | r | a | n | s   | r        | i   | р | t   | C   | f   |     | t | h | e   | Ş   | за  | ı m      | ιe  |   | a:  | n ( | d   | t | hе  |   |
| 14 | who   | o 1 | е | 1  | t h | е | r  | e ( | o f | Ε,  |   | a | С | C ( | r        | d   | i | n   | 3   | t   | . 0 |   | t | h e | 9   | b   | е        | s   | t |     | 0 : | f   | m | У   |   |
| 15 | a b : | i l | i | t  | Y   | a | n  | d   | k   | эе  | 1 | i | е | f.  | •        |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 16 |       |     |   | ΙI | N   | W | I  | Т]  | ΝI  | E S | S |   | W | ΗE  | ER       | E   | 0 | F   | ,   | Ι   |     | h | a | V   | Э   | h   | е        | r   | е | u : | n ' | to  |   | s e | t |
| 17 | mу    | h   | a | n  | f   | t | h  | i   | S   | 1   | 3 | t | h | C   | l a      | . У | - | 0 : | E   | D   | ) e | С | e | m ] | ⊃ € | er  | · ,      |     | 2 | 0   | 1 : | 2.  |   |     |   |
| 18 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 19 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   | _ |     |          | _   | _ |     |     | _   | _   | _ | _ |     |     |     | _        | - — | _ | _   |     |     | _ |     |   |
| 20 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     | F   | 'R  | A | N | K   | (   | 3 R | 2 A      | Υ   |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 21 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 22 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 23 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 24 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |
| 25 |       |     |   |    |     |   |    |     |     |     |   |   |   |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |     |   |   |     |     |     |          |     |   |     |     |     |   |     |   |